

**Supreme Court of the State of New York**  
**Appellate Division: Second Judicial Department**

D32691  
H/nl

\_\_\_\_\_AD3d\_\_\_\_\_

Submitted - October 11, 2011

WILLIAM F. MASTRO, J.P.  
RANDALL T. ENG  
ARIEL E. BELEN  
L. PRISCILLA HALL, JJ.

2010-08209

DECISION & ORDER

Charles Clark, et al., respondents, v Halmar Equities,  
Inc., et al., appellants.

(Index No. 3092/01)

---

Mound Cotton Wollan & Greengrass, New York, N.Y. (Jeffrey C. Crawford and Sara F. Lieberman of counsel), for appellant Halmar Equities, Inc.

Morenus, Conway, Goren & Brandman, Melville, N.Y. (Thomas B. Goren of counsel), for appellant Industrial Time & Systems, Inc.

Baker Greenspan & Bernstein, Bellmore, N.Y. (Robin R. Halstrom of counsel), for respondents.

In an action to recover damages for personal injuries, etc., the defendants separately appeal from an order of the Supreme Court, Queens County (Agate, J.), dated June 15, 2010, which granted the plaintiffs' motion pursuant to CPLR 3124 to compel the defendants' compliance with their discovery demands.

ORDERED that the order is affirmed, with one bill of costs.

The trial court is vested with broad discretion over the supervision of discovery, and its determination will not be disturbed absent an improvident exercise of discretion (*see Congel v Malfitano*, 84 AD3d 1145; *Peluso v Red Rose Rest., Inc.*, 78 AD3d 802; *Reilly Green Mtn. Platform Tennis v Cortese*, 59 AD3d 694). Under the circumstances of this case, the Supreme Court

October 25, 2011

Page 1.

CLARK v HALMAR EQUITIES, INC.

providently exercised its discretion in granting the plaintiffs' motion pursuant to CPLR 3124 to compel the defendants' compliance with their discovery demands.

MASTRO, J.P., ENG, BELEN and HALL, JJ., concur.

ENTER:

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Matthew G. Kiernan". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Matthew G. Kiernan  
Clerk of the Court