## November 29, 2012

## CASES

No. 239

In the Matter of Hon. Robert P. Apple, a Justice of the Pawling Village Court, Dutchess County.

1 No 230 SSM 28

Kendra Cividanes, Respondent,

V.

City of New York, Defendant.

Manhattan and Bronx Surface Transit Operating Authority, et al.,

Appellants.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, with costs, and the certified question answered in the affirmative, in a memorandum.

On consideration of the continuation of this Court's October 23, 2012 suspension, with pay, of Honorable

Robert P. Apple from his office of Justice of the

determined that the suspension continue, with pay,

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Ciparick, Graffeo,

Pawling Village Court, Dutchess County, it is

effective immediately.

Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Ciparick, Graffeo and Read concur.

Judge Pigott dissents in an opinion in which Judge Smith concurs.

2 No. 204 Kristin Kahkonen Dupree, Respondent-Appellant,

V.

James E. Giugliano, Appellant-Respondent. Order modified, without costs, by vacating the award for punitive damages and, as so modified, affirmed and the certified question not answered as unnecessary, in a memorandum.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Ciparick, Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

1 No. 237 SSM 45

Kayla James, &c., et al., Appellants,

V

Loran Realty V Corp.,

Defendant,

Frank Palazzolo, et al.,

Respondents.

No. 208

Richard M. Metz, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Mary Helen Metz, Deceased, et al.,

Respondents,

V

State of New York,

Appellant.

(And Six Other Related Claims.)

No. 202

The People &c.,

Appellant,

V.

Jeanne M. Vandover,

Respondent.

No. 199

The People &c.,

Respondent,

V.

Tyrone Watson,

Appellant.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, with costs, and the certified question answered in the affirmative, in a memorandum.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Ciparick, Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Order reversed, with costs, the claims dismissed and the certified question answered in the affirmative. Opinion by Chief Judge Lippman.

Judges Cipariok, Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott.

Judges Ciparick, Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Order affirmed.

Opinion by Judge Ciparick.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Order affirmed.

Opinion by Judge Graffeo.

Judges Ciparick, Read, Smith and Pigott concur. Chief Judge Lippman dissents and votes to reverse in

an opinion.

1 No. 234 SSM 38 In the Matter of Weeks Woodlands Association, Inc., et al., Appellants,

V.

Dormitory Authority of the State of New York, et al.,

Respondents.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, with costs. Under the particular circumstances of this case, we agree with the Appellate Division majority that the challenged project is substantially complete and that the proper course of action was to dismiss the appeals taken to that court as moot.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Ciparick, Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

## **MOTIONS**

Mo. No. 2012-1006 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Stephanie R. Ames, Appellant, V Dane G. Ames, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred Mo. No. 2012-1036 1 dollars costs and necessary reproduction William Anderson, disbursements. Appellant, New York City Department of Education, Respondent. 2 Mo. No. 2012-1004 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied. Susan Aranoff, Respondent, Gerald Aranoff, Appellant. Mo. No. 2012-1008 Motion to vacate this Court's August 14, 2012 dismissal order denied. Victor Barocas, Respondent, Deborah Barocas, Appellant. Mo. No. 2012-1005 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Wilma D. Clark, Appellant, V. Commissioner of Labor, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1019 Mahmoud Diarassouba, Respondent, V. Spencer Lubin, &c., et al., Appellants. Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1050 Christopher C. Evans, &c., Appellant, v. City of Mount Vernon, et al., Respondents, et al.,

Defendant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Mo. No. 2012-1095
 In the Matter of Gregory John Fischer, et al., Appellants,
 V.
 NYS Board of Elections, et al., Respondents.

Motion for reconsideration of this Court's October 18, 2012 dismissal order denied.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1039
In the Matter of Robert P. Jonas, Jr.,
Appellant,
V.
Walter Stackler, &c., et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

## SSD 64

Patricia Kane, as the Limited Administratrix of the Estate of Jeanne Kane and Patricia Kane, Individually,

Respondent,

v.

John Galtieri,

Appellant,

Marilyn Galtieri,

Intervenor.

Mo. No. 2012-1044

The People &c.,

Respondent,

V.

Mohd Majid,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2012-1034

The People &c. ex rel. Manuel Martinez, Appellant,

V.

Harold D. Graham, &c., Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1015 In the Matter of Charles McCarry,

Appellant,

V

Purchase College, State University of New York, et al.,

Respondents.

Appeal transferred without costs, by the Court <u>sua sponte</u>, to the Appellate Division, Second Department, upon the ground that a direct appeal does not lie when questions other than the constitutional validity of a statutory provision are involved (NY Const, art VI, §§ 3[b][2], 5[b]; CPLR 5601[b][2]).

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

3 Mo. No. 2012-1042
In the Matter of William B. Miner et al.,
Appellants,
v.
Town of Duanesburg Planning Board et al.,

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

4 Mo. No. 2012-1062

Respondents.

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

Gerard J. Ryan, Appellant.

3 Mo. No. 2012-999

Linda Vanderlyn, Appellant,

v.

Gina Daly et al., &c., Respondents. (And a Third-Party Action.) Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed as untimely.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1003 In the Matter of Elisha M.W. (Anonymous).

Administration for Children's Services, Respondent; Ronald W. (Anonymous), Appellant. (And Another Proceeding.) Motion for leave to appeal denied.

 Mo. No. 2012-1000
 Wells Fargo Bank Northwest, N.A., &c., Appellant,
 V.
 US Airways, Inc., Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

3 Mo. No. 2012-1040
In the Matter of WL, LLC,
 Appellant,
 v.
Department of Economic Development, Also
Known as Empire State Development,
et al.,

Motion for leave to appeal granted.

1 Mo. No. 2012-998 Wei Xu, Appellant, v. Fangruo Chen, Respondent.

Respondents.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the October 2011 Appellate Division order, dismissed upon the ground that such order does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution; motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the August 2012 Appellate Division order, denied.

3 Mo. No. 2012-1010 In the Matter of Dakota Y., &c.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

St. Lawrence County Department of Social Services,
Respondent;
Robert Y.,
Appellant.