# February 12, 2013

#### **CASES**

1 No. 83 SSM 1
In the Matter of Perry Bellamy,
Appellant,
V.
New York City Police Department,
Respondent.

4 No. 5
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Rafael L. Belliard,
Appellant.

4 No. 25
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Jarvis Lassalle,
Appellant.

4 No. 15
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Cornell Long,
Appellant.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, without costs, and certified question not answered on the ground that it is unnecessary. In denying the subject Freedom of Information Law request, the Appellate Division did not abuse its discretion.

Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Graffeo.
Judges Read, Smith and Pigott concur.
Chief Judge Lippman dissents in an opinion.
Judge Rivera took no part.

Order affirmed, in a memorandum. Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur. Judge Rivera took no part.

Order reversed, without costs, and case remitted to Supreme Court, Erie County, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein.

Opinion by Chief Judge Lippman.

Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur.

Judge Rivera took no part.

2 No. 14
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Michael Palmer,
Appellant.

Order reversed, without costs, and case remitted to Supreme Court, Kings County, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein. Opinion by Chief Judge Lippman. Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur. Judge Rivera took no part.

3 No. 8
In the Matter of the Arbitration between
Shenendehowa Central School District Board
of Education,
Appellant,
and
Civil Service Employees Association, Inc.,
Local 1000, AFSCME, AFL-CIO, Local 864,
et al.,

Respondents.

4 No. 13
The People &c.,
Appellant,
V.
Damien Warren,
Respondent.

Order affirmed, with costs, in a memorandum. Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Graffeo, Read, Smith and Pigott concur. Judge Rivera took no part.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Read.
Chief Judge Lippman and Judges Graffeo, Smith and Pigott concur.
Judge Rivera took no part.

#### **MOTIONS**

1 Mo. No. 2013-62 Vittorio Antonini, &c., et al., Respondents, v. Orazio Petito, et al., Appellants.

SSD 4

Philip Caprio and Phyllis Caprio, Appellants,

V.

New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, et al.,

Respondents,

and

Andrew M. Cuomo, in his Official Capacity as the Governor of the State of New York,

Defendant.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Appeal transferred without costs, by the Court <u>sua</u> <u>sponte</u>, to the Appellate Division, First Department, upon the ground that a direct appeal does not lie when questions other than the constitutional validity of a statutory provision are involved (NY Const, art VI, §§ 3[b][2], 5[b]; CPLR 5601[b][2]). Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1221 In the Matter of Village of Chestnut Ridge, et al., Appellants,

4 1

et al.,

Petitioners,

V.

Town of Ramapo, et al., Respondents.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal against Mosdos Chofetz Chaim, Inc., dismissed upon the ground that as to that party the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action/proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied.

Judge Rivera took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2012-1283
In the Matter of Kendall L.D.,
Appellant,
v.
Chad N.,
Respondent.
Attorney for the Child,

Motions for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2013-57 The People &c.,

Appellant.

Respondent,

V.

Richardson DeCastro, Appellant. Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Rivera took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2012-1218 In the Matter of John Doe, Appellant,

V.

New York State Commission on Judicial Conduct,

Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2013-43 In the Matter of Tuhin S. Dutta, Appellant, V.

Commissioner of Labor, Respondent.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.
Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2013-16

The People &c., Respondent,

V.

Philip Farrice,
Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1290
Galina Panova Fedoff,
Respondent,
v.
Boris Winthrop Fedoff,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Rivera took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2013-3
The People &c. ex rel. Dominic M. Franza,
Appellant,
V.
Michael Sheahan, &c.,
Respondent.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2013-24 The People &c., Respondent, v. Walter D. Fryer,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2013-66
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Robert Geehreng,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Rivera took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2013-26 Kateri Residence, &c., et al., Respondents, v. Antonia C. Novello, M.D., &c., et al., Appellants.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action/proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1292
David R. Kittay, &c.,
Appellant,
v.
Herbert Moskowitz, et al.,

Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Mo. No. 2013-28
In the Matter of Lorraine L. Mahoney,
Respondent,

V.

Steven J. Regan,
Respondent.
Attorney for the Children,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2012-1288
In the Matter of Kimberly Marshall,
Appellant,
V.

Pittsford Central School District, et al., Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1233 Judith May, Appellant, Lorenzo Scotto-D'Abusco, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the Court of Appeals does not have jurisdiction to entertain this motion for leave to appeal from the order of the Appellate Division entered in this action commenced in the Civil Court of the City of New York (see NY Const, art VI, § 3[b][7]; CPLR 5602). Judge Rivera took no part.

Mo. No. 2013-8 In the Matter of Victor Medina, Appellant, V. William F. Hulihan, &c., Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Rivera took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1294 In the Matter of The City of New York, et al., Appellants,

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

The Commissioner of Labor, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2013-54 In the Matter of Theophilus Y. Ojuola, Appellant, V.

New York State Division of Human Rights, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Judge Rivera took no part.

### 3 Mo. No. 2012-1227

Emanuel Polak,

Appellant,

V.

Carlton Resources, Inc., et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1190
In the Matter of Daniel Z. Rapoport, et al.,
Executors of the Estate of Boris Lurie,
Deceased.

American Friends of New Communities in Israel Inc., et al., Proposed Intervenors-Appellants, Richard Nadelman, et al., Respondents, Boris Lurie Art Foundation, Respondent, Elizabeth Goodman, Respondent.

## $3 \qquad SSD 6$

In the Matter of Mohamed Saad-El-Din et al., Individually and as Parents and Guardians of Student with a Disability R., an Infant, et al., Appellants,

V.

David M. Steiner, as Commissioner of Education, et al., Respondents. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from that part of the Appellate Division order affirming the order that denied the motion to intervene, dismissed upon the ground that such portion of the order does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution; motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the remainder of the Appellate Division order, dismissed upon the ground that absent an order of intervention, movants are not parties to the proceeding and thus lack capacity to challenge that part of the order.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court <u>sua sponte</u>, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Mo. No. 2013-21 Stephen Sicilia, Plaintiff, City of New York, et al., Respondents, JB Electric LLC, Appellant. (And Third-Party Actions.) 3 Mo. No. 2013-7 In the Matter of Christopher Stein, Appellant, V. Ithaca Police Department et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2013-32 County of Suffolk, &c., Appellant, Long Island Power Authority, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2012-1243 Nathaniel M. Swergold, Appellant, et al., Plaintiffs, Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al., Defendants, Thomas P. DiNapoli, &c., et al., Respondents.

(And Two Other Proceedings.)

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.
Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1287 In the Matter of Christopher T. (Anonymous). Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

St. Vincent's Children's Services, Inc., Respondent; Margarita V. (Anonymous), Appellant; et al.,

Respondent.

3 SSD 5
In the Matter of Ben Gary Treistman,
Appellant,
V.
Suzanne Mary Cayley,
Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2013-18

Deepak Trivedi,
 Appellant,
 v.

Robert Golub,
 Defendant,

Flushing Hospital Medical Center,
 Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1225
Turnberry Residential Limited Partner, L.P.,
Appellant,
v.
Wilmington Trust FSB,
Respondent.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court <u>sua sponte</u>, upon the ground that it does not lie (<u>see CPLR 5601</u>).

Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.

Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Rivera took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2013-38
In the Matter of Ulster County Sheriff's
Employees Association, CWA Local 1105,
Respondent,

V

Ulster County Sheriff's Department et al., Appellants.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2013-13
In the Matter of Latricha Van Dunk,
Appellant,
V.
Richard Bonilla,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

3 Mo. No. 2012-1234
In the Matter of Jack Vigliotti,
Appellant,
v.
State of New York Executive Division of Parole,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the issue presented has become moot. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Rivera took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2012-1252
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Kevin Williams,
Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2012-1215
Women's Interart Center, Inc.,
Plaintiff,
v.
New York City Economic Development
Corporation, et al.,
Defendants.
-----Women's Interart Center, Inc.,
Appellant,
v.
Clinton Housing Development Fund Corp.,
Respondent,
City of New York,
Intervenor-Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Rivera took no part.