## State of New York

## Court of Appeals

**Decisions**CASES

November 23, 2020

3 No. 94 SSM 23
In the Matter of Roland Green,
Respondent,
V.
Darwin LaClair, &c.,
Appellant.

3 No. 74
The People &c. ex rel. Fred Johnson,
Appellant,
v.
Superintendent, Adirondack Correctional
Facility, et al.,
Respondents.

2 No. 73
The People &c. ex rel. Chance McCurdy,
Appellant,
V.
Warden, Westchester County Correctional
Facility, &c., et al.,
Respondents.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, without costs (see People ex rel. Negron v Superintendent, Woodbourne Corr. Facility, \_\_ NY3d \_\_ [decided today]). Judges Rivera, Stein, Garcia, Wilson and Feinman concur. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judge Fahey dissent for reasons stated in the dissenting opinion in People ex rel. Negron v Superintendent, Woodbourne Corr. Facility (\_\_ NY3d \_\_ [Fahey, J. dissenting] [decided today]).

Order modified, without costs, by converting the proceeding into a declaratory judgment action and granting judgment in accordance with the opinion herein and, as so modified, affirmed.

Opinion by Judge Fahey.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein, Garcia and Feinman concur.

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion.

Judge Wilson dissents in a separate dissenting opinion.

Order affirmed, without costs.
Opinion by Judge Stein.
Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Garcia and Feinman concur.
Judge Fahey dissents and votes to reverse in an

opinion in which Judges Rivera and Wilson concur.

3 No. 76

The People &c. ex rel. Raymond Negron, Respondent,

v.

Superintendent, Woodbourne Correctional Facility,

Appellant.

No. 75

The People &c. ex rel. Angel Ortiz, Appellant,

v.

Dennis Breslin, &c. et al., Respondents.

3 No. 49 In the Matter of Marian T.

Lauren R. et al., Respondents; Marian T., Appellant. Order affirmed, without costs.
Opinion by Judge Garcia.
Judges Rivera, Stein, Wilson and Feinman concur.
Judge Fahey dissents in an opinion in which Chief
Judge DiFiore concurs.

Order modified, without costs, by converting the proceeding into a declaratory judgment action and granting judgment in accordance with the opinion herein and, as so modified, affirmed.

Opinion by Judge Fahey.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein, Garcia and

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion. Judge Wilson dissents in a separate dissenting opinion.

Feinman concur.

Order affirmed, without costs.
Opinion by Chief Judge DiFiore.
Judges Stein, Fahey, Garcia and Feinman concur.
Judge Wilson concurs in result in an opinion.
Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion.

## **MOTIONS**

Mo. No. 2020-578 Motion for leave to appeal denied. 342 East 50th Street, LLC, Respondent, v. Deborah Privitello, Appellant. 3 Mo. No. 2020-529 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Ally Financial Inc., Respondent, v. Bill's Towing Service, Inc., Appellant, et al., Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-547 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Anonymous, &c., Appellant; Attorney Grievance Committee of the Fourth Judicial Department, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied. Mo. No. 2020-605 Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Abass Bangura, Appellant.

Mo. No. 2020-562 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Beneficial Homeowner Service Corporation, disbursements. Appellant, v. Heirs at Large of Ramona E. Thwaits, &c., et Respondents, et al., Defendants. Mo. No. 2020-553 1 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Alda Bonilla, Appellant, Balla Bathily, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2020-554 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Alda Lizzette Bonilla Arzu, Appellant, v. Kevin Dana Gratt Associates, Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-555 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that it does not lie (see CPLR 5602 [a]). Alda Lizzette Bonilla Arzu, Appellant, v. Julia Belitsky, Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-556 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the 1 ground that the order sought to be appealed from Alda Bonilla, does not finally determine the action within the Appellant, meaning of the Constitution.

v.

Supreme Court of the State of New York, Appellate Division, Second Department,

Respondent.

Mo. No. 2020-528 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Roland Braxton, Appellant. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred 4 Mo. No. 2020-603 dollars costs and necessary reproduction Danen D. Danielak, Appellant, disbursements. v. State of New York, Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-535 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Carmine Dell Aquila, Respondent, v. Thomas Rubio, &c. et al., Appellants, et al., Defendant. Mo. No. 2020-592 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, Michael Fedeson, Appellant. Mo. No. 2020-651 Motion to vacate stay granted. In the Matter of Roland Green, Respondent, Darwin LaClair, &c., Appellant.

Mo. No. 2020-700 Motion to strike granted to the extent the challenged extra-judicial material in appellant's addendum and The People &c. ex rel. Fred Johnson, reply brief to which objection is taken is deemed Appellant, stricken. v. Superintendent, Adirondack Correctional Facility, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2020-590 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Irini Laskaratos, &c., disbursements. Appellant, v. Bay Ridge Hoyt Lender, LLC, et al., Respondents. 2 Mo. No. 2020-591 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Lebov, LLC, Appellant, State of New York, Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-571 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Eddy M., Appellant. Mo. No. 2020-589 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Moustapha Magassouba, Appellant, Cascione, Purcigliotti and Galluzzi P.C., et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of the Claim of Jacqueline McKay, Appellant, Southampton Hospital et al., Respondents. Workers' Compensation Board, Respondent. Mo. No. 2020-574 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the 1 ground that the order sought to be appealed from Merchant Factors Corp., does not finally determine the action within the Respondent, meaning of the Constitution. v. **David Cleary** Defendant, Banyan Mezzanine Fund II, L.P., Appellant. Mo. No. 2020-520 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed for failure to demonstrate timeliness as required by Rules of the Brian Mooney, Court of Appeals (see 22 NYCRR § 500.22 [b] [2]). Appellant, v. BP/CG Center II, LLC, et al., Respondents. (And Third-Party Actions.) Mo. No. 2020-606 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Northern Manhattan Is Not For Sale, et al., Appellants, v. City of New York,

Mo. No. 2020-587

Respondent.

Mo. No. 2020-599 Motion to strike granted to the extent the challenged extra-judicial material in appellant's compendium The People &c. ex rel. Angel Ortiz, and brief to which objection is taken is deemed Appellant, stricken. v. Dennis Breslin, &c. et al., Respondents. 2 Mo. No. 2020-565 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Tedy Pierre, Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2020-585 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c.,
Respondent,

v. Corey R.,

Appellant.

Appellants.

2 Mo. No. 2020-601 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction

Respondent, disbursements.
v. Judge Fahey took no part.
Town of Rhinebeck, et al.,

2 Mo. No. 2020-596 Motion for leave to appeal denied.

The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Benedicto Rivas,
Appellant.

Mo. No. 2020-530 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Charles Rochester, &c., Appellant, City of New York Police Department-FOIL et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2020-521 Motion for leave to appeal granted. Kim E. Schoch, Respondent, v. Lake Champlain OB-GYN, P.C., Appellant. 3 Mo. No. 2020-639 Motion by Samaritan Medical Center et al. for leave to appear amici curiae on the motion for leave to Kim E. Schoch, appeal herein granted and the brief is accepted as Respondent, filed. Lake Champlain OB-GYN, P.C., Appellant. Mo. No. 2020-531 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied. TRM Architecture, Design and Planning, P.C., Appellant, Destiny USA Holdings, LLC et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2020-604 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., does not finally determine the action within the Respondent, meaning of the Constitution. Randall Oppitz, &c., Appellant,

et al.,

Defendants.

2 Mo. No. 2020-572 Robert Wetter et al., Appellants, V. Northville Industries Corp. et al., Respondents. Motion for leave to appeal denied.

3 Mo. No. 2020-540 In the Matter of White Plains Fine Wine & Spirits LLC, Appellant,

V.

New York State Liquor Authority, et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

4 Mo. No. 2020-582 Glasco Wright,

Appellant,

v.

State of New York, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied.