State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

December 14, 2021

CASES

2 No. 74
In the Matter of Larry Hallock, &c.,
Appellant;
Grievance Committee for the Tenth Judicial
District,
Respondent.

1 No. 80
The People &c.,
Appellant,
v.
Sharon Lashley,
Respondent.

2 No. 90 SSM 29 In the Matter of Adonnis M.

Administration for Children's Services,
Respondent;
Kenyetta M.,
Appellant;
Rising Ground,
Nonparty-Respondent.

Order reversed, with costs, and matter remitted to the Appellate Division, Second Department, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein. Opinion Per Curiam.

Judges Fahey, Garcia, Wilson, Singas and Cannataro concur.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judge Rivera took no part.

Order reversed and case remitted to the Appellate Division, First Department, for consideration of the facts and issues raised but not determined on appeal to that Court, in a memorandum. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Fahey, Garcia, Wilson, Singas and Cannataro concur.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, appeal dismissed, without costs. There is no dispute that the issues presented are moot. We decline appellant's request to invoke the mootness exception.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Fahey, Garcia, Wilson, Singas and Cannataro concur.

2 No. 75

In the Matter of Mary Sheila Malerba, &c., Appellant;

Grievance Committee for the Tenth Judicial District,

Respondent.

4 No. 91 SSM 30

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Grace Pietrocarlo, Appellant.

4 No. 35

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

William A. Wilkins, &c., Appellant.

Order reversed, with costs, and matter remitted to the Appellate Division, Second Department, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein. Opinion Per Curiam.

Judges Fahey, Garcia, Wilson, Singas and Cannataro concur.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judge Rivera took no part.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, in a memorandum. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Fahey, Garcia, Singas and Cannataro concur. Judge Wilson dissents in an opinion.

Order affirmed.

Opinion by Chief Judge DiFiore.
Judges Garcia, Singas and Cannataro concur.
Judge Fahey dissents in an opinion, in which Judges
Rivera and Wilson concur.

MOTIONS

2 Mo. No. 2021-968

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Peter Carman,

Appellant.

Mo. No. 2021-965

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

v.

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al.,

Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

Mo. No. 2021-967

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

v.

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al.,

Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

Motion for poor person relief granted.

Motion by New York State Public Employees Federation, AFL-CIO for leave to appear amicus curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Motion by United University Professions for leave to appear amicus curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. The brief must be submitted in digital format within seven days.

Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Mo. No. 2021-974

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

v.

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al., Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

Mo. No. 2021-978

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

V

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al., Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

Mo. No. 2021-980

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

v.

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al., Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

Motion by Police Benevolent Association of the New York State Troopers, Inc. for leave to file a brief amicus curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days. Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Motion by New York State Law Enforcement Officers Union, Council 82, AFSCME, AFL-CIO et al. for leave to appear amici curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days. Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Motion by Court Attorneys Association of the City of New York, et al. for leave to file a brief amici curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. The brief must be submitted in digital format within seven days.

Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Mo. No. 2021-984

Danny Donohue, &c., et al., Appellants,

v.

Andrew M. Cuomo, &c., et al., Respondents,

et al.,

Defendants.

2 Mo. No. 2021-970

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Levan Easley,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-975

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

Levan Easley,

Appellant.

4 Mo. No. 2021-754

In the Matter of Robert C.E., Appellant,

v.

Felicia N.F.,

Respondent.

Motion by New York State Police Investigators Association, Local 4 IUPA, AFL-CIO, et al. for leave to file a brief amici curiae on consideration of the certified questions herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

Chief Judge DiFiore took no part.

Motion by The Legal Aid Society, Inc. for leave to appear amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

Motion by Electronic Frontier Foundation for leave to file a brief amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, an original and nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

3 Mo. No. 2021-566
EPG Associates, LP et al.,
Appellants,
v.
Cascadilla School et al.,
Defendants,

Barbara Cheung, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2021-605

Filomio Truck Sales, Inc., Appellant,

v.

City of New York, Respondent.

3 Mo. No. 2021-917

In the Matter of Ellen Gesmer, et al., Appellants,

v.

Administrative Board of the New York State Unified Court System, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2021-568

Jerry H. Goldfeder et al., Appellants,

v.

Cenpark Realty et al., Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2021-567

David Gridley, &c., Appellant,

v.

Turnbury Village, LLC, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Motion to dismiss appeal granted and appeal dismissed, with four hundred dollars costs and one hundred dollars costs of motion, upon the ground that the issues presented have become moot. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judge Fahey took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Rivera took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements. 4 Mo. No. 2021-572
Roger Hanley et al.,
Appellants,
V.
State of New York,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

3 Mo. No. 2021-948
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Mark A. Hartle,
Appellant.

Motion for assignment of counsel granted and John A. Cirando, Esq., c/o D.J. & J.A. Cirando, PLLC, 250 South Clinton Street, Suite 350, Syracuse, NY 13202 assigned as counsel to the appellant on the appeal herein.

4 Mo. No. 2021-785
Krystalo Hetelekides, &c.,
Appellant,
v.
County of Ontario et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied as unnecessary (*see* CPLR 5601 [b] [1]). Judge Fahey took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2021-966
Hunters for Deer, Inc. et al.,
Respondents,
V.
Town of Smithtown,
Appellant.

Motion by New York State Department of Environmental Conservation for leave to appear amicus curiae on the appeal herein granted only to the extent that the proposed brief is accepted as filed. The brief must be submitted in digital format within seven days.

1 Mo. No. 2021-563
In the Matter of Wendy Kreloff,
Appellant,
v.
New York State Division of Homes and
Community Renewal et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

1 Mo. No. 2021-757

Natalya Kurovskaya et al.,
Respondents,
v.

Project O.H.R. (Office for Homecare Referral), Inc.,

2 SSD 72 In the Matter of Tyler L., &c., Appellant.

Appellant.

1 SSD 69
Estate of Theodore Lipin, et al.,
Respondents,
v.
Joan C. Lipin,
Appellant.

SSD 70

Joan C. Lipin,
Appellant,
v.
Danske Bank,
Respondent,
Ulf Bergquist, et al.,
Respondents,
et al.,
Defendants.

1

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for a stay dismissed as academic.

Appeal dismissed, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that the two-Justice dissent at the Appellate Division is not on a question of law (*see* CPLR 5601 [a]).

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that it does not lie (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5601).

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that it does not lie (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5601).

1 Mo. No. 2021-523

A.M. et al.,

Appellants,

v.

Holy Resurrection Greek Orthodox Church of Brookville, et al.,

Respondents,

et al.,

Defendant.

4 SSD 65

In the Matter of Jasmine Maldonado, Respondent,

v.

Thomas Cappetta, Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-682

The People &c. ex rel. Sara Molinaro, on behalf of Wei Li,

Respondent,

v.

Warden, Rikers Island, &c., Appellant.

4 SSD 67

The People &c. ex rel. Gary H. Moore, Appellant,

v.

Superintendent of Marcy Correctional Facility, et al.,

Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Singas took no part.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

Motion for leave to appeal granted.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no appeal lies to this Court from an order of an individual Justice of the Appellate Division (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3 [b]; CPLR 5601).

3 Mo. No. 2021-728 In the Matter of Cheyenne Q. et al.

Schenectady County Department of Social Services.

Respondent;

Charles Q.,

Appellant.

4 SSD 68

Gail M. Rote et al.,

Respondents, v.

John A. Gibbs,

Appellant.

4 SSD 66

In the Matter of Ryan S., &c.,

Appellant.

Scott S.,

Respondent.

4 Mo. No. 2021-932

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Leon Thomas,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-695

In the Matter of Martin A. Wiley, Appellant,

V.

Epiphanie Musabyemariya, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Appeal dismissed without costs, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no appeal lies as of right from the unanimous judgment of the Appellate Division absent the direct involvement of a

substantial constitutional question.

Appeal dismissed, by the Court *sua sponte*, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved.

Motion for an extension of the time within which to apply for permission to appeal pursuant to CPL 460.20 granted and motion papers treated as a timely CPL 460.20 application.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

3 Mo. No. 2021-732
In the Matter of Shannon X.,
Appellant,
V
Koni Y.,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2021-954
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Marvin Yanez,
Appellant.

Motion for an extension of the time within which to apply for permission to appeal pursuant to CPL 460.20 granted and motion papers treated as a timely CPL 460.20 application.

Judge Singas took no part.