State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

May 6, 2021

CASES

No. 29

The People &c., Appellant,

v.

Charo N. Allen, Respondent.

No. 28

The People &c., Appellant,

v.

Kieth Brooks, &c., Respondent.

1 No. 49 SSM 4

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

George Brown, Appellant.

No. 38

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

Cesar Garcia,

Appellant.

Order reversed and case remitted to District Court, Suffolk County, First District, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein.

Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein and Fahey concur.

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Judge Wilson concurs in a separate dissenting opinion.

Order reversed and case remitted to Criminal Court of the City of New York, Bronx County, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein. Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein and Fahey concur.

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Judge Wilson concurs in a separate dissenting opinion.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, in a memorandum. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein and Garcia concur.

Judge Fahey concurs in result upon the ground that defendant's arguments are unpreserved.

Judge Wilson dissents in an opinion, in which Judge Rivera concurs.

Reargument ordered for a future Court session. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Fahey, Garcia and Wilson concur. 1 No. 32 U.S. Bank National Association, &c., Respondent,

DLJ Mortgage Capital, Inc., Appellant.

No. 27

The People &c., Respondent, v.

Kenneth Slade, Appellant.

4 No. 35
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
William A. Wilkins, &c.,

Appellant.

Reargument ordered for a future Court session. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Fahey and Garcia concur. Judge Wilson took no part.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Garcia.
Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Stein and Fahey concur.
Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Judge

Wilson concurs in a separate dissenting opinion.

Reargument ordered for a future Court session. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Fahey, Garcia and Wilson concur.

MOTIONS

1 Mo. No. 2021-176 A&F Hamilton Heights Cluster, Inc., et al., Plaintiffs, James Fendt, Appellant, V. Urban Green Management Inc., et al., Defendants.	Motion for leave to appeal denied.
WHGA Hamilton Heights Cluster, Inc., et al., Intervenors-Respondents, v. Hamilton Heights Cluster Associates, L.P., et al., Intervenors-Defendants, A&F HHC Equities, LLC, Intervenor-Appellant. Safeguard Realty Management, Inc., et al., Nonparty Respondents. (And a Third-Party Action.)	
2 Mo. No. 2021-359 Susan Aranoff, Respondent, V. Gerald Aranoff, Appellant.	Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.
1 Mo. No. 2021-215 The People &c., Respondent, v. Michael Bean, Appellant.	Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Mo. No. 2021-121 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Derrick Brown, Appellant. 3 Mo. No. 2021-142 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of John J. Darwak et al., Appellants, v. City of New York, et al., Respondents, et al., Respondent. Mo. No. 2021-144 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Michael R. Desroches, does not finally determine the action within the Respondent, meaning of the Constitution. v. Heritage Builders Group, LLC, et al., Appellants. Mo. No. 2021-209 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred 1 dollars costs and necessary reproduction In the Matter of Warren Diamond, disbursements. Appellant, v. Scott Diamond, Respondent, Nacirema Management Associates, LLC, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2021-181 Motion for leave to appeal granted. Chief Judge DiFiore took no part. In the Matter of Raymond Dieffenbacher, Appellant, Melissa Jackson, &c., et al.,

Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2021-148
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Rory Dolan,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

1 Mo. No. 2020-676 In the Matter of Steven R. Donziger, &c.

Attorney Grievance Committee for the First Judicial Department,
Respondent;
Steven R. Donziger,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Chief Judge DiFiore and Judges Rivera, Stein, Garcia and Wilson concur. Judge Fahey dissents.

1 Mo. No. 2021-168
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Scott E.,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

1 Mo. No. 2021-206
In the Matter of Express Scripts, Inc.,
Appellant,
v.
Metropolitan Transit Authority, et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Mo. No. 2021-369 Jesus Ferreira, Appellant,

v.

City of Binghamton et al., Respondents.

Motion by New York State Academy of Trial Lawyers for leave to file a brief amicus curiae on consideration of the certified question herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed. Two copies of the brief must be served, nine copies filed, and the brief submitted in digital format within seven days.

2 Mo. No. 2021-124 Motion for leave to appeal denied.

The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.

Anastelio Garcia,
Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-164 Motion for leave to appeal denied.

In the Matter of Michael Garvey,
Appellant,
V.

Town of Clarkstown, et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

3 Mo. No. 2021-128
In the Matter of William H. Hoffay, et al.,
Appellants,
V.
Town of Sand Lake, et al.,
Respondents.

Mo. No. 2021-135

In the Matter of Lisa Gerbino, et al.,

Appellants,

John Whalen, &c., et al., Respondents.

v.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Mo. No. 2021-126
 Sheldon Lamar Hunt,
 Appellant,
 V.

 New York City Department of Education,
 Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

2 Mo. No. 2021-137
Georgiy Koyko, &c.,
Appellant,
v.
City of New York, et al.,
Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2021-203 In the Matter of Warren McDowell, Appellant,

V.

Blue Point Fire Department, Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2021-115

The People &c., Respondent,

v.

Jose Medina,

Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-250

Metropolitan Lofts of NY, LLC, Appellant,

v.

Metroeb Realty 1, LLC,

Defendant,

RedSky Capital, LLC,

Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2021-147

In the Matter of Jill S. Meyer, &c., Appellant,

v.

Helen Diane Foster, et al., Respondents. On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that no substantial constitutional question is directly involved. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion to expand the record dismissed as academic.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the orders sought to be appealed from do not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2021-141
County of Nassau, et al.,
Appellants,
Chautauqua County, et al.,
Intervenors-Appellants,
v.
Expedia, Inc., et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

4 Mo. No. 2021-184
In the Matter of the Arbitration Between New York Schools Insurance Reciprocal,
Appellant;
Deborah Kalbfliesh,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed as untimely (see CPLR 5513 [b]; 2103 [b] [2]).

2 Mo. No. 2021-112
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Yuleiny Pena-James,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

1 Mo. No. 2021-162
Penthouse Global Media, Inc.,
Appellant,
v.
The Executive Club LLC,
Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

3 Mo. No. 2021-190
Elizabeth Prendergast,
Respondent,
V.
Maria Swiencicky,
Appellant,
et al.,
Defendant.

Motion for reargument of motion denied. Motion for other relief dismissed upon the ground that this Court does not have jurisdiction to entertain it (*see* NY Const, art VI, § 3).

Mo. No. 2021-130 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Alroy Richards, disbursements. Appellant, Security Resources, Respondent, et al., Defendant. Mo. No. 2021-27 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction In the Matter of Rifenburg Construction, Inc., disbursements. Appellant, v. Town of Sand Lake et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2021-84 Motion by New York Construction Materials Association, Inc. for leave to appear amicus curiae In the Matter of Rifenburg Construction, Inc., on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and Appellant, the affidavit is accepted as filed. v. Town of Sand Lake et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2021-166 Motion for leave to appeal denied. 1 Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, Warren Singleton, Appellant. Mo. No. 2021-101 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Jason Smith, Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2021-154
Ann Tarzia, &c., et al.,
Appellants,
v.
Brookhaven National Laboratory, et al.,
Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal appeal dismissed upon the ground that the orders sought to be appealed from do not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

3 Mo. No. 2021-30 In the Matter of Troy Sand & Gravel Co., Inc. et al.,

Appellants,

v.

Town of Sand Lake et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

2 Mo. No. 2021-180

The People &c.,

Respondent,

V.

Pedro Vega,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

2 Mo. No. 2021-132

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Richard West,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.