SUPREME COURT, CIVIL BRANCH Richmond County 26 Central Avenue, Staten Island, N.Y. 10301

Office of Self Help 25 Hyatt Street 5th Floor 718 675-8589

How to Take an Appeal

Note: All persons involved in a lawsuit should consult an attorney. This office gives you information, forms and instructions on court procedures. As an office of this court, we cannot give legal advice or act as your advocate.

A person who is dissatisfied with an order or judgment of the court in his or her case, may, under certain circumstances, take an appeal to a higher court. This summary attempts to outline what is appealable, where an appeal is prosecuted, and how the appellate process is started. This summary does not, however, address how to prosecute the appeal in detail. **Anyone thinking about an appeal should consult an attorney**. Information about how an appeal is to be argued, how many copies of appellate briefs must be filed, and similar matters may be obtained from the Appellate Division, Second Department, 45 Monroe Place Brooklyn, New York 11201, telephone number 718-722-6324 or email <u>AD2-clerksoffice@nycourts.gov</u>. The procedures of the Appellate Division are accessible at <u>www.nycourts.gov/courts/ad2/</u>.

Electronic Filing

The New York State Unified Court System operates an electronic filing system for cases filed and litigated in various state courts, including the New York State Supreme Court. This system is the **New York State Courts Electronic Filing System ("NYSCEF")**.

In Richmond County Supreme Court, Civil Branch, electronic filing is mandatory. That is, new cases must, with four exceptions (Matrimonial, Article 78, Election Law, and Mental Hygiene law matters), be commenced through the NYSCEF system and filings with the court thereafter must be filed through NYSCEF. Thus, a person seeking to commence a new civil action or special proceeding (other than one covered by one of the exceptions) must file the commencement documents with the County Clerk of Richmond County through the NYSCEF system. Subsequent filings with the court after commencement, such as the submission of motion papers, must be filed via NYSCEF.

Although e-filing is generally mandatory in Richmond County, the rules permit persons who appear on their own behalf in this court to be exempt from the obligation to e-file.

Information on how the NYSCEF system works for unrepresented litigants can be found on the NYSCEF website at <u>www.nycourts.gov/efile</u>.

What is an Appeal?

An appeal is a procedure by which a party in one court may seek a judgment or order overturned in a higher court. The party who proceeds with the appeal is called the **appellant**. All parties against whom the appellant seeks reversal (regardless of their posture in this court) are referred to as **"respondents"** with respect to the appeal. The appeal is not a form of new trial. Basically, the same evidence that was before the trial court is placed before the appellate court and the parties to the appeal argue, on papers and at a brief oral argument, that the trial Justice, in reaching his or her decision on that evidence or the issue in question, did or did not commit an error that requires reversal. This evidence is called **the record on appeal (**or **the record)**.

The Appellate Court Structure

The appellate court that hears appeals from the Supreme Court, Civil Branch, Dutchess, Kings Nassau, Orange, Putnam, Queens, Richmond, Rockland, Suffolk and Westchester County are, almost without exception, the Appellate Division, Second Department. The next level in the appellate hierarchy is occupied by the Court of Appeals, Albany, New York, which is the State's highest court. An appeal from the Supreme Court, Civil Branch, Dutchess, Kings, Nassau, Orange, Putnam, Queens, Richmond Rockland, Suffolk, and Westchester County should be prosecuted in the Appellate Division, Second Department. Thereafter, it may be possible to pursue an appeal in the Court of Appeals, but the conditions for doing so are beyond the scope of this summary. The Court of Appeals will hear almost no appeals that do not first make their way through the appellate process in the Appellate Division.

What Rulings are Appealable?

The general rule is that the only thing that may be appealed from is a **judgment** or **order**. An order, roughly speaking, is a written determination of the court that resolves a request of a party for some relief prior to trial. This sort of request is called a **motion**.

A judgment is a determination by the court that sets forth the results of an entire case or of a discrete claim for relief in a case. A judgment might, for instance, award plaintiff a sum of money or award judgment to defendant dismissing a case. Or a judgment may resolve only one or some of number of claims made in a case. Generally speaking, a judgment is signed by a Justice or by the County Clerk in accordance with a written directive issued by the Justice or the verdict of a jury.

The mere signing of an order or judgment does not set running the time during which an appeal must be instituted (see below for the deadline). Generally speaking, an appeal may only be taken from an order or judgment that has been **entered**. The deadline to take the first steps in an appeal depends upon the date that a copy of the judgment or order was served upon the parties to the case together with formal written notice that it has been entered (**notice of entry**). In this context, "entry" is the formal filing in the

Office of the County Clerk and recording in the Clerk's records of the order or judgment in question. The "entry" date is reflected by the date stamped by the Clerk on the original order or judgment. The stamp reads "Filed NY County Clerk [date of entry]."

In contrast with most orders, most judgments are not automatically "entered." The prevailing party must appear before the Judgment Clerk of the County Clerk 130 Stuyvesant Place, 2nd Floor and request entry of he judgment. When the papers are in proper form, the Judgment Clerk will enter the judgment formally in the records of the County Clerk, at which point the judgment officially becomes binding and is appealable. Ordinarily, it is the responsibility of the prevailing party to prepare the form of judgment that is to be signed by the Justice and/or entered by the Clerk.

Only a party to a case who is "aggrieved" (i.e., has been harmed) by an order or judgment may pursue an appeal of it. Generally speaking, all judgments are appealable as a matter of right, even if they are not final. CPLR 5701(a)(2). An order is appealable if it arises out of a motion made on notice and if it

- (i) grants, refuses, continues or modifies a provisional remedy, such as an injunction;
- (ii) settles, grants, or refuses an application to resettle a transcript or statement on appeal;
- (iii) grants or refuses a new trial (with exceptions);
- (iv) involves some part of the merits;
- (v) affects a substantial right;
- (vi) in effect determines the action and prevents a judgment from which an appeal might be taken;
- (vii) in certain cases, determines a statutory provision of the State to be unconstitutional; or¹
- (viii) grants a motion to reargue or determines a motion for leave to renew.

¹ Some other matters are appealable as of right. See CPLR 5701(a)(3). Compare CPLR 5701(b). Some other matters are appealable only by permission. CPLR 5701(c). Permission to appeal can be granted only where the aggrieved party makes a motion requesting permission to appeal.

The Deadline for Taking an Appeal

An appeal as of right must be taken within 30 days after the party taking the appeal has been served with a copy of the judgment or order from which the appeal is to be taken, together with notice of its entry. Annexed hereto is a copy of a notice of entry.

Usually, the party who succeeded in this court is the one who serves the copy of the order or judgment with notice of entry. However, the losing party may do so if he or she wishes. In that case, the 30-day period commences from the time of this service.²

With only a few, very narrow exceptions, **this 30-day period may not be altered**. The parties cannot extend this time by their agreement, nor may the court grant a motion to extend the time.

The failure of the appellant to take the appeal in timely fashion will deprive the Appellate Division of jurisdiction to hear the appeal. That court will and must dismiss the appeal. The appeal may not be pursued even if all other parties to the case wish that to happen. In short, the unrepresented person is advised as strongly as words permit to pay close attention to the calendar when thinking about an appeal and to proceed quickly.

How to Take an Appeal

2

An aggrieved party who wishes to take an appeal as of right must do so by <u>serving and filing</u> a document known as a **notice of appeal.** Annexed is a copy of a form of notice of appeal.

To carry out the required service step, a copy of the notice of appeal must be served upon every other party to the lawsuit. In this instance, service may be made by regular first-class U.S. mail; by registered or certified U.S. mail, though either form of mailing is not required; by personal delivery to the attorneys for each of the parties; or by personal delivery to any other parties not represented by counsel. See also CPLR 2103. These papers must be served by someone who is over 18 years of age and <u>is not</u> a party to the case. The party appealing (the appellant) may not himself or herself serve the papers.

The appellant should also arrange for service in the same manner of a document known as **a pre-argument statement** (see CPLR 5531). This provides certain information about the case in which the appeal is being taken. The statement will be transmitted to the Appellate Division.

The person who has effectuated service must complete an affirmation of service which describes when service was made and upon whom service was made.

As stated, the appellant must also file the notice of appeal with the court. The filing is made with the County Clerk 2ND Floor at 130 Stuyvesant Place (the filing is not made with the Appellate Division). The appellant must file with the County Clerk two sets of documents, each in a legal (blue) back: (1) an

The 30-day period applies to appeals as of right and those brought by permission. As to appeals that require permission, a notice of appeal is not served and filed at the outset; permission must be obtained first. To obtain this, a motion for permission must be made and the motion must be made within the 30-day period or else the opportunity to appeal will be lost. If the motion is made on time, the fact that it is not decided until after the 30-day period has expired does not affect the opportunity to appeal.

original notice of appeal, to which must be annexed the original affirmation of service; and (2) a second original notice of appeal, the pre-argument statement; a copy of the order or judgment from which the appeal is being taken, and an affirmation of service.

At the time of filing, the appellant must pay a filing fee of \$65 to the County Clerk (payable by cash, a certified bank check or money order payable to the Richmond County Clerk). In Richmond County, if you received a poor person order from the Supreme Court at the beginning of your case, you will not have to pay the \$65 fee for filing a notice of appeal. Otherwise, this fee, as well as the costs associated with "**perfecting**" the appeal in the Appellate Division (explained below), may be avoided only if the appellant obtains a **poor person order** from the Appellate Division, not from this court. It is not certain that the Appellate Division will grant a poor person order in any particular case. Some time is required to obtain such an order. Therefore, an appellant seeking a poor person order must do so quickly, to allow time to obtain the order and file the notice of appeal in a timely manner. As mentioned earlier, there is a rigid time limit within which an appeal must be taken. Failure to take an appeal in a timely fashion will result in the dismissal of the appeal.

Cross-Appeals

A party who has not initiated an appeal may, upon receipt of a notice of appeal, wish to take an appeal too, that is, **cross-appeal**. Any party taking a cross-appeal must also be "aggrieved" in some way, i.e., he or she must have actually been harmed in some respect by what is contended to have been an error of the court. The cross-appealing party must also serve and file a notice of appeal (or make a motion for permission to appeal, if required) within 30 days after service of the order or judgment with notice of entry, or within 10 days after service upon him or her of the adverse party's notice of appeal or motion for leave to appeal, whichever is longer.

Effect of the Appeal on the Order of Judgment

The taking of an appeal does not necessarily halt the effectiveness of the order or judgment from which the appeal is taken. If an appeal is taken by the State of New York or any of its governmental subdivisions, the order or judgment which is the subject of the appeal is automatically stayed, that is, put on "hold." CPLR 5519(a). Other litigants will receive an automatic stay if they put up monies or other assets or post a bond sufficient to satisfy the judgment and commit to paying over in the event the appeal is unsuccessful.

In an appropriate case, if the appealing party makes a motion to stay effectiveness of the order or judgment during the appeal, this court (or the Appellate Division) may, in its discretion, issue an order granting the stay. See CPLR 5519(c)

"Perfecting" the Appeal

In addition to <u>taking the appeal</u> (initiating the appellate process) in the manner described above, the appealing party must <u>pursue the appeal</u> in a defined manner, which is known as "perfecting the appeal."

If the appeal is taken from a judgment or order arising out of a trial or hearing at which sworn testimony was taken in open court, the appellant must "order" the transcript of those proceedings so that the Appellate Division can have before it and can review a record of what transpired in the trial court. Most decisions issued by the Supreme Court, Civil Branch, Kings and Richmond County are issued based on motion papers only and therefore in such instances no transcript is required.

In cases where the order or judgment arose out of a trial or hearing at which oral evidence was taken in open court before a court stenographer, the appealing party must serve on the stenographer a written request for the transcript and must deposit the fee for the transcript, which is calculated based upon the length of the transcript. The office of the Court Reporters is located at 26 Central Avenue, Staten Island, N.Y. 10301 and the phone number is 718 675-8725. This request must be served within the period allowed for the taking of the appeal, discussed above.

The parties may agree that only a portion of the proceedings will be transcribed. This agreement should be in writing and should identify the portions of the transcript to be transcribed. The transcript is often very expensive, and it may be in the interest of both sides to a case to limit expense by entering into an agreement of this sort.

Once the court reporter has transcribed the record of the proceedings in response to a request, he or she will deliver an original and one copy of the transcript to the appealing party. The appealing party should review it for errors. The appealing party should then serve a copy of the transcript on the other party, together with a list of suggested corrections, identified by page and line. The parties should consult one another and endeavor to agree as to what corrections should be made. If the parties cannot agree, the dispute will have to be resolved by the trial Justice, but it is strongly suggested that the parties should not impose this burden on the court. CPLR 5525.

If the parties can agree, they can prepare a written statement of the case, which may be used in place of a transcript. CPLR 5525(d).

The appealing party must also prepare and submit the "record on appeal." The appellant should review Article 55 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules and the rules of the Appellate Division, Second Department for additional information about the record, deadlines for briefs, and other things. The appellant may also contact the office of the Appellate Division, Second Department, 718 722-6324 for additional information. See also

www.courts.state.ny.us/courts/ad2/

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

Index Number

Plaintiff(s)/Petitioner(s),

- against-

NOTICE OF ENTRY

Defendant(s)/Respondent(s).

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the attached is a true copy of an in this matter that was entered in the office of the Clerk of the Supreme Court, Richmond County on the day of, Dated:

To:

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

Index Number

HON.

Plaintiff(s)/Petitioner(s),

- against-

NOTICE OF APPEAL

Defendant(s)/Respondent(s).

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that the hereby appeal(s) to the Appellate Division of the Richmond Supreme Court in and for the Second Department from an entered in this case in the office of the Clerk of Richmond County on which

and this appeal is taken from

- \Box each and every part of that document as well as from the whole thereof; or
- \Box the portions of the document that

Dated:

To: Hon.

County Clerk, Richmond County

Attorney for

Attorney for

Attorney for

Attorney for

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF RICHMOND

Index Number

Plaintiff(s)/Petitioner(s),

- against-

CIVIL APPEAL PRE-ARGUMENT STATEMENT

Defendant(s)/Respondent(s).

1. Title of Action:

2. There has been no change in the title of the action except as follows:

3. Individual name, law firm name, address, and telephone number of counsel for each appellant:

4. Individual name, law firm name, address, and telephone number of counsel for each respondent:

5. Court and County from which appeal is taken: Supreme Court, Richmond County.

6. Appeal is from an entered on,

7. There is no related action or proceeding now pending in any court of this or any other jurisdiction except:

8. The nature and object of the cause(s) of action or the special proceeding:

- 9. Result reached in the court or administrative body below:
- 10. Grounds for seeking reversal, annulment, or modification:
- 11. There is no additional appeal in this action except:

Dated:

Appellant

Plaintiff(s)/Petitioner(s), Index Number AFFIRMATION OF SERVI COMMENCEMENT OF LIT	
Defendant(s)/Respondent(s).	
I , affirm, depose and say:	
I am over 18 years of age and am not a party to this case.	
I reside at	
On, at , I served a true copy of the foll in the following manner:	owing papers,

□ <u>Personal</u> By personally delivering the papers to

Service at

The individual I served had the following characteristics [check one box in each Category]

Sex	Height	Weight	Age
□ Male	□ Under 5'	□ Under 100 lbs.	□ 21 - 34 years
Female	□ 5'0" - 5'3"	□ 100 - 130 lbs.	□ 35 - 50 years
	□ 5'4" - 5'8"	□ 131 - 160 lbs.	□ 51 - 61 years
	□ 5'9" - 6'0"	□ 161 - 200 lbs.	□ Over 61 years
	□ Over 6'	\square Over 200 lbs.	
Color of skin:			

Hair color: Other identifying features, if any:

- □ <u>Mail</u> By mailing the same in a sealed envelope, with postage prepaid thereon, in a post office or official depository of the U.S. Postal Service within the State of New York, addressed to the last-known address of the addressee(s) indicated below:
- Overnight
Delivery
ServiceBy depositing the same with an overnight delivery service in a wrapper properly addressed. Said
delivery was made prior to the latest time designated by the overnight delivery service for overnight
delivery. The delivery service used was

Name(s) and address(es) of person(s) served by mail/overnight delivery:

I, ______, (Print or Type Name), affirm this ____ day of _____, ____, under the penalties of perjury, under the laws of New York, which may include a fine or imprisonment, that the foregoing is true, and I understand that this document may be filed in an action or proceeding in a court of law.

Server's Signature