

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK  
NEW YORK COUNTY**

PRESENT: HON. DEBORAH A. KAPLAN

*Administrative Judge*

-----X

JACOB HINDLIN,

INDEX NO. 650468/2019

Plaintiff,

- v -

LUCASZ GOTTWALD, LAWRENCE SPIELMAN, RENEE  
KARALIAN

Defendant.

**ADMINISTRATIVE  
ORDER**

-----X

This action was commenced on January 24, 2019. The RJI and Commercial Division addendum were filed the same day. On the RJI form, plaintiff's counsel listed the case of *Hindlin v. Spielman, et al.*, Index No. 158642/2018 (pending before the Hon W. Franc Perry) as a related action.

The court's assignment procedures for related cases provides that "if the new case is designated as related, it will automatically be assigned to the Justice who was assigned the earlier case provided that that case has not already been disposed of" (see, RJIs and Assignments, <http://www.nycourts.gov/courts/1jd/supctmanh/RJIs-Assignments.shtml>). However, through clerical oversight, the case was assigned to a Commercial Division part rather than to Justice Perry. As such, this action is presently pending before the Hon. Barry Ostrager in the Commercial Division (Part 61).

Notices of Appearances were filed on behalf of each of the defendants on February 15, 2019. Stipulations extending defendants' time to answer until April 9, 2019 were also filed on February 15, 2019.

By letter dated February 22, 2019, Jeffrey M. Movit, Esq., counsel for defendants Gottwald and Karalian, and on behalf of defendant Spielman, request that this action be assigned to the Hon. Andrea Masley in the Commercial Division (Part 48). Counsel submits that the instant action is related to two cases pending before Justice Masley, to wit: *Hindlin v. Prescription Songs LLC, et al.*, Index No. 65197/2018 and *Advanced Alternative Media, Inc. v. Hindlin*, Index No. 6559116/2018.

By letter also dated February 22, 2019, plaintiff's counsel, Andrew Goodman, Esq., does not oppose request. He agrees that this case is related to the actions assigned to Justice Masley and should be transferred to her. He additionally submits that the proceeding pending before Justice Perry should also be transferred to Justice Masley.

Upon review, I agree that all four of these cases have interrelated allegations and issues and are related. Having them all before one Judge would be beneficial and serve judicial economy. Accordingly, the General Clerk is directed to transfer the instant case (presently assigned to Justice Ostrager) and the proceeding (presently assigned to Justice Perry) to Justice Masley.

DATE: 3-25-19



Hon. Deborah A. Kaplan  
Administrative Judge  
Supreme Court, New York County  
Civil Branch