

Transcript: Hate is A Virus Too - A FHW Youth Initiative with Council For Unity

Co-hosts: Franklin H. Williams Judicial Commission

Council For Unity

May 15, 2020

Judge Webber:

During the civil rights movement, we still had a mass discrimination obviously against African Americans. African Americans were targeted. There were still lynchings going on. There were of course the end of lynching, but there's still lynchings going on. We still had issues in terms of African Americans being able to vote. '68 was right after this where African Americans were basically given the right to vote. We still had some issues concerning exercising that vote. So you still have mass discrimination, racism, and discrimination against African Americans.

Judge Webber:

Also during this time in the '60s, you had the bombing of African American churches. And so again, these laws were put into effect to try to alleviate those types of behavior and to obviously criminalize it. 1968, that law also, as I said, made it illegal to interfere with individuals in terms of their housing. In the '60s as well you had the bombing of not only churches, but also someone wanting to move, African American moving into a "white neighborhood" they would be the subject of harassment. In the south you had the Ku Klux Klan burning crosses on their lawns, but there would be bombs thrown into their homes. There would be things painted on their garage doors, on the doors, et cetera. Which by the way, goes on today in some sections of the United States as well.

Judge Webber:

In 2009, we had the Congress pass ... I'm sorry, let me back up. 1988, also we had the Church Arson Prevention Act, which I mentioned before. We had numerous bombings of African American churches in the south and also in the north as well. In 2009, Congress passed and President Obama signed the Matthew Shepard and the James Byrd Jr. Hate Crimes Prevention Act.

Judge Webber:

As some of you may be aware, Matthew Shepard was a homosexual and he was killed based upon the fact that he was a homosexual. And so these laws went into effect in order to deal with crimes based on gender, as gender identity, as well as sexual orientation. Again, returning to today, we have numerous crimes against individuals who are transgender. They've been a number of assaults and murders of individuals who are transgender. Now many of the States have hate crime laws and many do not. So several States do not have comprehensive hate crime laws. The states, Georgia, Indiana, Utah, Wyoming, those states do not have hate crime laws whatsoever. And I'll get to that in a second. When you talk about a hate crime law, and New York does, New Jersey does, so here in the Tri-state area we do have these laws.

Judge Webber:

When you talk about a hate crime, it's not like it's on the book this is a hate crime, hate crime murder, arson, rape. That's not what we're talking about. What we're talking about for the most part, and in

most states including New York, is that if you commit an assault, for example, and the object of that assault, the victim of that assault, the reason you've assaulted that individual is because of their race because of their gender, because of their sexual orientation, because of their religion. If the reason that you are assaulting them is one of those listed, then that becomes a hate crime. And here in New York, it would be assault as a hate crime. And what that means here in New York is that you would be subject to greater enhanced punishment. So if you assault someone, perhaps it's going to be three years, but the reason you assaulted that person was because of their race because of their gender, because of their sexual orientation, it's probably going to be four to five years.

Judge Webber:

So it has to be proven that the reason that you assaulted that person, again, the reason you assaulted them was because of their race, because of their sexual orientation, because of their gender. And we're not only talking about individuals. Again, if you set a church on fire, a synagogue on fire, the reason that you're setting that synagogue, or the reason that you're setting the church on fire is religion based, you're doing so because of some hatred or bias obviously towards Jews or towards Christians, towards Catholics. So that does not mean that in those states which do not have hate crimes that the crime will not be prosecuted. The crime will be prosecuted, but the crime will be prosecuted just like any other assault or any other murder or any other arson.

Judge Webber:

Those states who don't have hate crimes, it's very interesting. Many of them talk about freedom of speech. And the reason they talk about freedom of speech ... So for example, if you walk up to someone who is African American, or you walk up to someone who is Asian American and you call them by some type of derogatory name, that in those other states would not necessarily mean that it's a hate crime. And those states say, well, you know what, you have a right to call that person by that name. And we are in that person may find it to be a derogatory term, and you and I would most probably find it to be a derogatory term. Those states say, well, you know what, they have a constitutional right, the person has a constitutional right to call that other person by that name.

Judge Webber:

Here in New York if you do call someone by a derogatory name, et cetera, you still have to prove that that was the reason that you then went forward and you assaulted that individual. New Jersey has basically the same laws as in New York where you assault someone or you commit some crime against that person and it's based upon their race, based upon their, their religion, sexual orientation, ethnicity, et cetera. Also intimidation. If you intimidate individuals, again, based upon one of the factors listed, that would also include a hate crime.

Judge Webber:

So as I stated, most of the States do have some type of hate crime legislation. The legislation normally is going to be that it will be somewhat enhanced. One of the interesting cases recently here in New York was *People vs. Moorjani*. In this particular case, an individual was held guilty for writing the words, the N word F-U-C-K as well as P-U-S-S-Y on the walls of a female bathroom with a black marker in a school. And that was considered to be a hate crime. That was considered to be a hate crime against females because it was in a female bathroom. The court said that the reason that this occurred was obviously because they were targeting females and also the court specifically stated that there is no constitutional right, no freedom of speech, which would be protected by engaging in that type of conduct.

Judge Webber:

Another case in New York also, defendant was a Caucasian male hurled numerous racial slurs towards an African American victim prior to shooting that African American victim in the abdomen. The court held that that was attempted murder as a hate crime, assault also as a hate crime, and found that there was proof that the defendant assaulted this individual, attempted to kill this person really based solely upon the fact that the individual was African American.

Judge Webber:

So now with COVID-19 as Ms. Johnson mentioned, and other presenters will talk about as well, now we have issues in terms of crimes against Asian Americans. We have crimes against Asian Americans. We have crimes against members of the Jewish community as well. As Ms. Johnson mentioned, there have been a couple of cases directed towards members of the Jewish community as well. You made the call in the news there was an individual who had, I believe, gone to some type of function in Rockland County, and they believed that there was a cluster in Rockland County. There was also a belief that there was some type of cluster in Brooklyn as well. And so that was thought to be the "fault" of these Jewish individuals. And therefore there was an influx of cases against members of the Jewish community.

Judge Webber:

I'll get on to the incidents. As I said, there have been those incidents against Asian Americans. There have also been incidents against members of the Jewish community as well. The New York City Commission on Human Rights has instituted a program in conjunction with the mayor's office encouraging individuals to report any incidents of hate crimes as a result of COVID-19. There was actually a virtual town hall which was held on April 30th. Members of the New York City Commission on Human Rights as well as the Mayor's Commission attended. Also, I think the offices of the District Attorneys, so that'd be Bronx, Manhattan, Brooklyn and Queens. I'm not sure about Staten Island. But they all have a separate Bureau or unit within the office that deals specifically with hate crimes and are dealing now specifically COVID-19 complaints relating to hate crimes. Now, if you, what they're stating is that you should report it.

Judge Webber:

You should call 311 if it is occurring presently in front of you. So you see someone, an Asian American, African American, what have you, who is being assaulted or there's some criminal activity against that individual or a group based upon COVID-19. If it's happening in front of you, then they're asking that you call 911, and that you report it. Ronald Lauder has an online portal to report coronavirus hate crimes. The website is listed in one of the slides, and we'll certainly make that available to you. It is important that there be a record of exactly what is going on, and that there'll be a record of these types of assaults and these types of behavior, that we have a record of them.

Judge Webber:

Unfortunately, what we're finding is that they are being under reported. Individuals are simply kind of walking away and not doing anything about it. The video that we attempted to share a little while ago showed someone was videotaping that so that's why we have a record of that. The question is, how is a distinction of proof derived of a solely witnessed base? Yeah, that is in general what is occurring. So they're going to be witness based. Obviously, if there's a witness to it or you are a witness to it, or someone else is a witness to it, obviously that's going to be easier to prove. Otherwise many times it's going to be your word against their word. But yeah, the distinction is going to be pretty much proof

derived. We have other resources. New York State has what's called an Anti-Hate Crime Resource Guide. Which I don't know how helpful that is. Do we really need a guide to tell you how not to hate? But anyhow, they do have that.

Judge Webber:

As I said, the district attorney's offices, AGs offices as well, they have units dealing with this. Morris County, they have a special ... Morris County is in New Jersey. They have a special website, which again is in the slides where you would lodge any complaints or any instances of hate crimes and bias crimes. And they talk about, again, if you find that you are the victim of these types of crimes, based upon your black ... They say they have black, based upon your religion, based upon your ethnicity, based upon your sexual orientation, LGBTQ, Asian, American, et cetera, that you should report this to them. And they have a website also with Morris County in terms of reporting it. And this is actually very recent.

Judge Webber:

In April, again, NYPD was asking, encouraging people to call 911 to report any bias crimes, again, with COVID-19. They actually tweeted this and NYPD tweeted this and stated that they are continuing to arrest individuals who are responsible for COVID-19 Asian based hate crime and hold them accountable. I was not able to see the number of actual prosecutions. The number that I was able to find was 15 in terms of arrests in New York County. I wasn't able to find the numbers in the other counties, but in New York County there were 13 actual arrests for COVID-19 related bias assault, et cetera. Of the 13, nine were against Asian Americans. And two were against individuals who we believe to be Jewish. And then the remaining was unknown. But the majority were against Asian Americans. Those cases, there were arrests, they're pending prosecution by the district attorney's office here in New York County. So thank you.

Ms. Johnson:

Thank you, Judge Webber. Judge Webber, before you conclude can we just go back to the slide where you indicated Georgia does not have a hate crimes law, the State of Georgia, and just talk for a minute about the situation where if the state does not have a hate crimes law they can still be prosecuted under the federal law. And we know that this recent case of Ahmaud Arbery wherein two citizens of Georgia allegedly tried to make a citizen's arrest and shot Ahmaud Arbery. There have been various issues concerning prosecution. It took quite some time for that to take place. Now there is an arrest, charges are being made and consideration of bringing a hate crimes charge under the federal law is being considered since Georgia does not have a state hate crimes law.

Judge Webber:

Yeah, that's an excellent question, Ms. Johnson. I cannot comment on a pending case, even though the pending case is not in New York. I can't comment on pending case. But your point is well taken. Although a state does not have a its own hate crimes law, the feds can come in and take it. It becomes very political, however, and then the question becomes whether or not the federal prosecutors will step in and actually take it and actually take over the prosecution. So it does become political, so you do have to look to who that federal prosecutor is, to that particular federal prosecutor's office to see what their political leanings may or may not be, and then whether or not they will then come in and actually take over the prosecution. So you do have an issue, as usual, where you're talking about the federal prosecutors versus the state prosecutors, and whether you want to step on toes or exactly how you want to proceed. But yes, most definitely if the individual state does not have a hate crimes law, and

here in Georgia that you're talking about they do not have one, the federal government could come in. Federal prosecutors could go in and take over that prosecution.

Ms. Johnson:

Okay. Thank you so much. That's excellent. Moving on to our next panelist, Chris Clark.

Chris Kwok:

Hi everybody.

Ms. Johnson:

Chris, after a stellar 15 year career at the New York district office of the United States Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, where he mediated hundreds of employment disputes, Chris continued his career with the premier mediation arbitration firm JAMS. The great work that he does in his day job as a mediator arbitrator serves him very well as a leader and activist in the Asian community. Chris?

Chris Kwok:

Yeah, thank you so much for that introduction. Those are very kind words. And thank you for this opportunity to speak to the audience. I'm sure that on a Friday afternoon an audience like this is going to be very engaged and interesting in the topic. So I'm going to talk a little bit about the history. And Nadine actually did a really great job in the beginning talking about who gets associated with disease and why. And I think that's really at sort of the heart of what I want to talk about. And if you see the first slide, it's called Asian's disease and scapegoating, I'm not Jack Chin. That's my friend from a UC Davis School of Law. He's allowed me to use the slides. He's given me permission and I want to leave his name up there.

Chris Kwok:

So if you could sort of flip through the slides, Chinese immigration and the entry of Chinese people to America in large numbers began in the mid 1800s and really accelerated after the end of slavery. So actually African Americans and Chinese Americans, their histories in this country are intimately interlinked. Because with the end of slavery, which we all of course support applaud it, there was a great need for labor in America. And one of the places that they found supplied labor in that period was China. China was going through hard times economically in that era and people, young men in particular, were being shipped around the world. Not as slaves, but as essentially indentured servants. So they went around the world not only to America, but to South America, to the Caribbean. And when they entered America, it challenged America's sense of itself again.

Chris Kwok:

As we know, racism has been an ongoing issue. It's been central to sort of the American story in one way or another since the beginning. And if you flip through the slides, if you could look at the slide, there's three ghosts sort of coming out of San Francisco Harbor. I don't know if you can see that. One of them is leprosy and in the left hand of that ghost is Chinatown because a lot of people did associate in that period sickness with the Chinese immigrants and laborers that were there. So in 1900, there was a bubonic plague outbreak in San Francisco and immediately the blame fell on the Chinese. They go, oh the Chinese are here. It must be in Chinatown. So what they did was they closed down Chinatown and they forced both the Chinese and Japanese people that were living in San Francisco, Chinatown, or the area to take an experimental vaccine.

Chris Kwok:

And they quarantined all Asians in neighborhoods. They didn't do it by neighborhood because if you're a white family in that area, they would just draw the quarantine line around you. Because they kind of essentially saw sort of whites as not carriers of the disease, but if you were Chinese or Japanese or Asian, then you were. And I think it doesn't surprise maybe some of you, or maybe it does surprise you, to hear that these ideas have been long present in sort of the ether of American society. And so there was a lawsuit about this and maybe to for us as lawyers the lawsuit was eventually successful for the Chinese. It was found to be an illegal plan because there was zero evidence that the bubonic plague outbreak was the fault of the Chinese laborers. It was actually, of course, as they found out the fault of rats. That's the rats that sort of transmitted the disease. So I wanted to give you just that sort of a little bit of background, a little sort of unknown history that just kind of sort of essentialization of people and a disease ...

PART 1 OF 4 ENDS [00:24:04]

Chris Kwok:

Sort of essentialization of people in a disease is not new to a racialized society. I want to encourage everyone to oppose that type of essentialization. Many Asians are now seen as carriers of the disease, I think. They're perceived to be carriers of the disease no matter whether they're sick or not, or they're carriers are not. And that type of essentialization is something that we really need to not believe, not act on. And if we see it being acted on, we should really do our best to stop that. Or take video, as we said, that might be the best thing.

Chris Kwok:

So, just wanted to thank you. I think that Honorable Doris Ling-Cohan, who graciously invited me, is going to take over the rest of my time. But just wanted to share that history with you and to encourage everyone to stand against it. Thank you.

Nadine:

Thank you, Chris. Chris, before you conclude, could you talk a little bit? Okay, I'm getting feedback, so...

Chris Kwok:

I hear you.

Nadine:

Can you talk a little bit about the history of mask wearing in Asian communities?

Chris Kwok:

Yeah.

Nadine:

I was reading something very fascinating about it recently, and how it's not normally been tied to disease, per se.

Chris Kwok:

That's right. It's just tied to a sense of community, let's say. It started in actually Japan, right? In the modern era, Japanese people during the flu season would wear a mask, and you might wear the mask because you were sick, but you also might wear the mask to protect yourself from other people's sickness. That became prevalent in Asia during flu season, and during these pandemic outbreaks, as soon as people dealt with the outbreak of COVID-19, people all across Asia started wearing masks.

Chris Kwok:

It was way to show concern, out of a community concern for others. And then a lot of Asians in America, because they have relationships with people in Asia or came from there recently, or came from there, or they have family members there, they started wearing masks. And before it became an order in America, I'll tell you, many Asian Americans and myself were fearful of wearing masks outside because we felt that if we wore a mask, we were telling people in America, "I'm sick", and then we would become a target of harassment or violence, so it became sort of a complicated sort of issue.

Chris Kwok:

Now everyone's ordered to wear a mask, so I guess I could safely wear a mask, and not be worried about being targeted just for wearing a mask. But I'd be honest with you, as an Asian American, and my wife feels the same way, we feel targeted and fearful for our physical safety in a way that we never had to deal with. Not like African-Americans had to deal with for centuries, quite honestly. Like Ahmaud going for a jog, why is going for a jog dangerous to your health in this country?

Chris Kwok:

Of course, it's a terrible history of racial injustice. Asian-Americans are part of that, they experience racial injustice. It's a different intensity, there's no question. But at the same time, there's no question that Asian-Americans have had a long history of discrimination and racism, but of course it's slightly different. If you go back, if you draw the picture big enough, it's all the same thing. It's all about who is in power, and who gets to decide.

Chris Kwok:

2009, we had the pig flu, where did that originate? It originated in America. No one ever thought to say, "This is the American flu that somehow white people, because they love eating pigs, man, that's the American flu." I think that is to remind people, yes, the virus was identified in Wuhan, China, and there's probably good criticism of the Chinese government that we need to engage in, but we need to separate the Chinese government from the Chinese people, that we need to separate essentializing people, saying, "This people is that. This people is dirty, these people are our disease carriers", that's the sort of thing we want to get away from.

Nadine:

Yeah. Thank you for that, Chris. In talking about the Asian-Americans and Black history experience, the Black civil rights movement experience, there are many wonderful, great Asian-American icons, such as Grace Lee Boggs. She was an activist, civil rights icon, and her vision challenged us to imagine and create a better world. She was the daughter of Chinese immigrants. She worked with Martin Luther King Jr. She lived to be a hundred years old, and she never wavered in her commitment to the labor movement, the civil rights movement and the black power movements.

Chris Kwok:

She was a New Yorker. She was a New Yorker and she moved to Detroit and met her husband there, because she thought, it's labor, it's the center of the action. People don't remember these stories Nadine, so we need to remind people that there are existing people, and remind people of the existing connections. Asian-Americans have benefited from the civil rights movement in a hundred different ways that I can't even begin to count, and I talk about that all the time.

Chris Kwok:

Asians face discrimination, but we also perpetrate it, so we need to be aware, and I think that's the message that we definitely want to take out of this, because you look at how it's falling on African-Americans in terms of the health outcomes, in terms of all those... Wearing a mask becomes problematic for African-American males, and we need to be on the lookout, we need to deal with those things, at the same time as we talk about anti-Asian harassment and violence, which has become, I think, a revived issue, unfortunately.

Nadine:

Thank you. Okay. So now, our next presenter, just as Ling-Cohan has blazed trails in a number of areas, she serves on the New York State Supreme Court Appellate Term First Department. She is the first woman of Asian descent to be elected to the Supreme Court, and she is subsequently the first Asian woman to be appointed to an appellate panel. So with that, before Justice Ling-Cohan speaks I think we have another video, Mary, could you cue up that video?

Nadine:

If you see the link to the video, you must link the video individually. Please, everyone click on the link to that video so that you all will see it at the same time. I believe that video is approximately three minutes or so, thank you. For those of you who can't find the link to the video please look in the chat area, the link is in the chat area. Thank you. Video number two, the link is in the chat area. Have you all viewed the video? Okay. All right. Now we will hear from Justice Doris Ling-Cohan. Justice Cohan?

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

Can you hear me now?

Nadine:

Yes, we can hear you now. Thank you.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

I'm on a computer and a phone because I'm having trouble connecting. Good afternoon, everyone, sorry for the technical difficulties. I am so happy to be here. I'm so happy you folks from Council for Unity are here and the other high school students as well. So, I wear two hats, I'm a commissioner on the Franklin H. Williams Commission, so I know the important work that they're doing, I thank my colleagues for organizing this, and fellow presenters for being part of this. I'm also a member of Council for Unity, so I know how much you as students, as Counsel for Unity members, are really a force for change and good in the world, and in your school and your communities. I know that you try to bring people together in your schools, in your communities, and I know that you folks are certainly caring individuals and you want to do good in the world.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

I thought that it was important to present this topic to you because this is about racism. This is about injustice. And I know that the whole concern of Council for Unity is to bring people together. You've been presented with a lot of important information. We will be presenting you with even more information as we go on, but I wanted you to think about instances in which you face discrimination, and we are going to open it up to dialogue so that you can also tell us instances where you faced similar hate crimes, or some sort of harassment, and how you felt in that instance and whether you identified with any of the people on the video you just saw.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

So we want to hear from you and we also want to hear your ideas. You've been given some ideas, the case... I can't comment on an active case either, but some of the cases came to light because some people who were not part of the incident took videos, or they figured out a way of intervening in safety. That's something that the City Human Rights Commission has done trainings on, and maybe in the future, we can actually present somebody from the Human Rights Commission to talk to Counsel for Unity members and other high school students about that. Because that's an important thing, you are really a force for good, and I know that you are, and I know that that Kyle, and your teachers, and [inaudible 00:41:13] center we send our love to and hope he gets better soon.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

That's what you folks talk about all the time. I was at the induction lunch and I saw the oath that you folks took to basically empower yourself and your communities, and I think that's so important. I know sometimes people talk down to you, and I know that you folks have such great ideas. I hosted a bunch of Council for Unity kids at our courthouse, maybe some of you were there, and I noted how intelligent you folks were, the questions that you asked, the interests that you have in society, in law, and I know that you folks all can be a force for good.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

I want to touch on something that Nadine had asked about, and want to present a fuller picture so that you get perhaps a different perspective. So, we talked about that there are actual hate crimes on the books, but there are also other laws on the books that a person could be charged with. So even if there's not a hate crime law in the book, the person can still be charged for say, assault, or for murder or something like that, or harassment. Even though there's no special hate crimes that the person can be charged, or hate crime law that the person can be charged, they still can be charged with the underlying crime.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

So just to be clear, it's not that they're getting away scot-free, it's just that perhaps that extra enhancement, that extra charge can not be placed for whatever reason. It's still important to make sure that if you witness a crime, to call 911 at the time, I encourage people to do that. If you can take video safely, that's another way of also making sure that you are a force for good. If you hear harassments, say on social media, or discrimination, you can be a force for good. Sometimes it takes that one person, and other people will chime in and say, "You know, that's just not cool. Why are you saying something about so-and-so like that?"

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

What Chris had talked about in terms of demonizing whole groups of people, that happens to so many groups, so we can be a force for good and say, "Hey, that's just not acceptable." I think that if enough of us do that, we can be that change. It's important to really understand that sometimes when people need an explanation, or need someone to blame because they don't understand something, or they don't want to take responsibility, that happens too. It's easy to blame something. For example, the bubonic plague was blamed on Asians, and the various illnesses or viruses are blamed on other people, like the Spanish flu. The Spanish flu was actually in America, and it was the Spanish folks who actually reported about it, the media, and it became the Spanish flu. So it's the Spanish people.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

It's so easy to demonize people, and what Council for Unity is all about, as you know, is that we are all individuals, we're all humans and we all connect. That's something that we have to always keep in mind because we want this role to be a better place, and you folks can be that force to make this world a better place. I think I've spoken enough. I want to really thank everybody, especially the students who have joined us, because it means that you're caring, that you're people who really want to make the world better and will be making the world better, because I believe in every single one of you. I've met so many Council for Unity members, and I know that you all have it in you to make this world a better place, and you are every day.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

I know there's these tough times, tough times for everybody, but hang in there. Kyle, I know, is such a cheerleader, and really rounding up people and making sure that people are connected, and don't be shy about reaching out. We will be doing more of these forums, hopefully in the future. We did one in the courthouse, we're going to hopefully do one talking about people's careers and things that folks face in going up the career ladder. I want to thank you very much, and I'll turn it back to Nadine. I think we're going to be opening up for comments and questions, and I encourage you to talk about that.

Nadine:

Thank you so much Judge Ling-Cohan. Before we do that, we have one more panelist, speaker LaShaya Costello, is a program site coordinator for Counsel for Unity, and she is an alumna of the program as well. In 2007, Ms. Costello was a part of the first Council for Unity chapter in her Bronx high school, formerly known as Leadership Institute. So LaShaya is going to tell you a little bit about herself, her journey, and perhaps make some commentary on the program so far. Thank you so much LaShaya.

LaShaya Costello:

Hello, hi. Good evening everyone.

Nadine:

Good evening.

LaShaya Costello:

My name is LaShaya Costello. I'm an alumni for Council for Unity. Back in 2007 at my high school... So Council for Unity, the dream... I had my ups and downs while being a student, it gave me the opportunity...

PART 2 OF 4 ENDS [00:48:04]

LaShaya Costello:

... while being a student. It gave me the opportunity to have another way of getting out my situation at that time. I was that student who always fight, always into trouble and things like that. Kind of somewhat hung out with the wrong crowd, but it gave me another outlook as far as having other, excuse me, other opportunities. And basically to make myself a better person. I decided to stick around. My site coordinator was actually Kyle Harmon. So shout out to him, because he helped me a lot through that process. I put myself through college.

LaShaya Costello:

I attended BMCC for my associate's degree in criminal justice, and I decided that I wanted to take my studies further. So now I currently am in a master's program in John Jay for criminal justice, as well as working for Counseling Unity. Working with Counseling Unity now, it just helps me, as well as help the students as far as letting them know that they always have someone to be there, that they don't have... Just because they may be in a situation now that they don't always have to be there. There's other alternatives to make things better for themselves. And I'm just always there for the support and everyone just know how to contact me. Thank you.

But not that lady:

Thank you.

Lady:

Thank you so much, Josiah.

Nadine:

All right. Before we get to the next section which... We've heard about some solutions early on. Justice Troy Webber and Justice Doris Ling-Cohan had mentioned about calling 3-1-1 and 9-1-1, but there are other resources and solutions that we can talk about. But before we get to that, there's another video to put you in the mood. And if you need to get a sip of water or anything like that, that this will give you a chance to do that.

Nadine:

And so all of our panelists will join in the next session and talking about resources and solutions. Thank you. The link is provided in the chat for our third video. And this video is just the other day it was Stevie Wonder's birthday. So this video incorporates a song along with some graphics and some photos which ties very nicely in with our theme of this evening's program. Thank you

Nadine:

So Love's in need of love today. Stevie Wonder's song. I hope some of you are fans of Stevie wonder. For evil to flourish, it only requires good men to do nothing. Technology without hatred can be a blessing. Technology with hatred is always a disaster. That's a quote by Simon Wiesenthal. He was a Holocaust survivor and a human rights activist.

Nadine:

Injustice anywhere is a threat to justice everywhere. Darkness cannot drive out darkness. Only light can do that. Hate cannot drive out hate. Only love can do that. Those were quotes by Martin Luther King, Jr.

So let's talk about solutions, other solutions. You'll see the panel on your screen. There are some resources and solutions, Ten Ways to Fight Hate from the Southern Poverty Law Center. So let's start with Lashea. Lashea, let's chime in and talk about some solutions that you may have dealt with in your experience that you think might be applicable to the situation that we're talking about. Okay. Lashea's coming up.

Kyle Harmon:

Lashea just got a... She just messaged me. She may be on an important call.

Nadine:

Okay. So Kyle, I'm going to defer to you now. All right, so let's chime in number one, act do something.

Kyle Harmon:

Okay. So one, I guess in speaking, I guess on behalf of council and I would like to welcome if you will, Mr. Jacobs, our spark council at Forest Hills, Ms. Sanchez, who's an assistant principal and Mr. [inaudible 00:56:46] is also an advisor because they're kind of my example. One of my favorite quotes from Bob Dissenter, our founder is that when you bring everyone together, there's no one left to fight.

Kyle Harmon:

So while we're working hard to bring the kids together and help them understand that their differences aren't as different as they think they are, you have administrators who become a part of that network of change. And I think that's what really makes things effective when you become an actual community, bringing back the concept of having a community, and the community, working together for that cause of promoting unity and changing hatred.

Nadine:

Okay, great. And thank you. Welcome. Welcome. So number two, joint forces, which I mentioned one Asian-American previously Lee Boggs, Yuri Kochiyama is another, she's a Japanese American civil rights activist who started her civil rights journey in Harlem. During the 1960s, she founded a group called Asians Americans for action, which sought to build political movement tied to the struggle for black liberation, the friendship and political Alliance that she had with Malcolm X virtually changed her life. So number two, join forces, the judge, Tory Weber, please chime in.

Judge Webber:

Well, as I stated, there are numerous websites there, the 3-1-1, 9-1-1 in terms of reporting these types of crimes, these types of behavior. And as a judge, Lynn Collins stated if you're on social media and you say something that is going on, I you should actually report it and I'll say something about it. I think it's important that you take a stand. I recognize that it's not easy, but I think it's important that you do so.

Nadine:

Yes, absolutely. All right. So Judge Ling-Cohan support the victims. How do we, how do we do that?

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

So many times I think people blame the victim and it's funny, cause I've just had an inter-change with somebody really in social media who was immediately, Oh, why was that person walking in the street at

that hour? It's like, you know what people do that because maybe they were going to pick up their child. Maybe they had just come off from work. It's not the person's fault.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

So encouraging the victim to report the crime is very important saying that it's important to report the crime. And some people say, Oh, the police won't do anything. Well certainly the police won't do anything if nobody reports a crime. So the first thing is to actively report the crime and to ensure that it's reported also as a hate crime, to make the case that it's a hate crime and you can support the victim by going with them to the police by calling 9-1-1 with them, whatever it is and don't ever, ever, ever blame the victim.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

It's never the victim's fault. It's not because they were in the wrong place. It's not because they wore the wrong thing. It's not anything like that. So that's an important piece to it and throughout, the person may be very upset. Sometimes may even lash out at you, try to be understanding. Be kind. That's a very important piece to it. And if you see on social media, somebody say, Oh that person asked for it. Nobody asks to be in victim of crime. It's just not possible. Nobody puts a sign on their forehead, says, okay, beat me up today. They are a victim and they need to be a survivor and you can help them be a survivor by supporting them; by encouraging them.

Nadine:

Yes. Thank you. All right, so Chris, what about education? Educating yourself? What are the ways in which people and students can get education, facts, truth. Those are the things that really matter in terms of getting justice for, for these types of crimes.

Chris Kwok:

Yeah, absolutely. I think programs like this is the start. I think that the way to approach education is that one should never stop learning that you always question the premise upon what your life has been sort of... Society will tell you, this is you. This is your life. This is how you should be. This is what you should believe. As a citizen in this country, particularly if you're non white, you need to question those premises. You need to understand the history. You need to read constantly. You need to, you need to criticize, you need to be self-reflective.

Chris Kwok:

And I think that these programs and council for unity helps encourage that. So I think that's wonderful. So I think that anyone that's here is doing the right thing and to spread that virus. So to speak that idea, to always educate themselves, to always learn, to always break through conventional sort of modes of thinking so that you can be a citizen and just do one thing in the city government, in your community. And that will lead to many other things. I think that's just one small thing. You'll be surprised where it leads in terms of what kind of change it brings about.

Nadine:

Right? Absolutely.

Judge Webber:

Okay. I just wanted to step in one second. I think that's really important in terms of education, that Chris just mentioned. And I noted also that you thought there was a question from one of students in terms of whether it was mandatory or whether it was automatic and now hate crimes are prosecuted, etc. And it's really important that people understand exactly how is prosecuted or not prosecuted because the more information you have, the better you are armed in terms of how to deal with it.

Judge Webber:

And so, you know how to follow up on it. You know what you're talking about when you are reporting these incidents. You know whether it is, in fact, you can be considered a hate crime, whether it could be considered COVID-19, etc. So the more information you have and the more knowledge you have concerning the subject, I think it's very important.

Judge Webber:

The other thing I wanted to mention is, as African Americans, and I think, I don't recall what the... I think Chris mentioned this as well, in terms of African American males now wear a mask and how it does create many issues. There was also a case recently where African American professor, and I don't know if you saw this was driving with his 10 year old son. I think it was outside of Rhode Island. And he was pulled over by two vehicles. And basically what they told him was, using the 'n' word, get out of here you don't belong here. We don't want you in this area.

Judge Webber:

And as I stated, he was a professor and I believe he might've been a professor at Dartmouth because it wasn't far from his location, but that's neither here nor there. He actually had a home there, which again, not matter, but he was, he resisted the urge to escalate the situation and he talked it down and he was like, fine, no problem.

Judge Webber:

We're leaving etc. And he got into his vehicle with his son and drove back to their home and he reported it. So it just began, it shows that even in the most quote, unquote normal situation where you're just driving down the road, not bothering anyone you, because of these times, again, people feel that they can they're, they're in a bias and prejudices can come out at this time. And so you have to be very careful as an African American, as an Asian American, etc, not to give them any farther in terms of escalating these situations, which becomes very, very difficult.

Nadine:

Yes, absolutely. Thank you. Thank you everyone. All right. So we're going to open it up now for Q and A. If anyone has any questions, I believe Mary is going to unmute. So if anyone wants to chime in, one thing I want to do is I want to give a shout out to Tony Walters. I saw that he tuned in a while ago. Tony Walters is the head of the court's workforce diversity office. Thanks for joining in Tony.

Tony Walters:

You're welcome, Nadine, thank you.

Nadine:

So do you have any comments or questions? We're not just taking comments and questions from students. We're taking them from everyone.

Tony Walters:

No, great program. Thank you, Mary Lynn for the invitation. And just hoping that the students will take some of the great words of counsel from this presentation to heart and will help them on their respective journeys.

Nadine:

Okay. Thank you. Thank you so much. Well, if there are no questions, let's just have a final parting thought from each of our panel questions. Do I hear your question? Hello? All right. Well...

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

I'm interested Nadine. Maybe we can ask if any of the students have ever encountered harassment or discrimination and whether they identified with any of the videos or how, if they have any ideas in terms of making the world a better place, so stuff like this doesn't happen.

Nadine:

Sure. I see Alex. Alex is in the chat. How can I chime in? Alex, are you on the call or are you seeing the video? If you're seeing the video, you can unmute yourself and chime in.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

So Alex, if you see something that looks like a microphone, it might be on the bottom of your screen or somewhere else, you hit the mic and there's like a strike sign on it, striking the microphone. If you unmute yourself, we should be able to hear you. Yeah, I see that you've un-muted yourself. So we should be able to hear you. Why don't you start talking to us. Thank you.

Kyle:

No tap your mic one more time.

Lady:

[inaudible 01:08:08] telephone. Just bring it closer to you and then speak to us.

Alex:

I got it. I got it. [crosstalk 01:08:16] Oh, I'm here. Hi, talk to you later.

Nadine:

Welcome, Alex.

Alex:

Oh my goodness gracious. I am filled with tears. There are tears of kind of sadness, but the joy that I feel has way overcome the sadness that I have listening and watching everybody talking. And I want to see the reaction of the kids watching, because that's what it's all about. They're our future. And they're the

future of planet and what we have. We just want to share the peace, love and happiness, and black and white together, that we had in the sixties. And every color together.

Alex:

And I can't believe I'm like, I don't mean to sound silly or insecure, but, or un-involved, but I can't believe that things are happening like this today. Maybe my eyes are closed and my heart's not open enough, but I can't believe that there's, there's the amount of hate going on because all I want is to have love going on and I want to be able to do something to make it happen. And I want to do it together. And I need somebody to guide me. I'm sorry. I'm just very teary and overwhelmed because it's beautiful.

Nadine:

Yes, Alex. You're right. It is. It's an overwhelming time for so many reasons. And to have this issue on top of it, all, it really is mind boggling that here we are in the 21st century, dealing with the same issues that we've dealt with a hundred years ago,

Alex:

Well, seems like it, right?

Nadine:

Yeah. So, the solutions that we've talked about, education supporting the victims, joining forces with allies, from groups, creating diverse coalitions, doing some things, standing aside, taking a video reporting. Reporting is extremely important as Justice Ling-Cohan and Justice Webber talked about because if the police and the authorities don't know that these things are happening, they have no way to deal with it.

Nadine:

I know some people don't want to do it, but it really, if you are the friend or family member of someone who's encountered something like that, they really need to be supported and encouraged to do that because there are so many institutions today and organizations today that are supportive of such whereas years ago, there were not such a supportive institutions.

Alex:

Yeah. I understand that. Reporting it, but hell about just making it not happen so much. I feel like I need to move back into Manhattan and walk around and just give everybody a peace sign and hug everybody walking down the street. What is it that we can do to make this happen less often? We need people like Kyle and Gary K for walk around the street too, and just share love.

Nadine:

Yes. That is a solution like Chris talked about, education. Education is extremely important and other solutions there are lots of other more acceptable alternative solutions, car rallies, petitions, Twitter storms, writing letters, and articles, email, phone calls, other social media posts to counteract... To counteract these instances of xenophobia bias.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

Even a post, when you see article about somebody being attacked, or racially profiled, just sending it around and say, this is just not acceptable. It's not acceptable. And just to, to make other people aware that it's happening and that there is.

PART 3 OF 4 ENDS [01:12:04]

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

... aware that it's happening and that there is societal disapproval. Your friends will say, Oh, Alex is upset about this. Oh, I didn't even know about this. It's a way of educating people. I mean, we all have a role that we can educate people. There are people... you are not in, perhaps, the Asian American community. This is happening. It happened to my daughter. It happened to so many Asian Americans that I know of. I, once actually, many years ago, taught a college course and I had each one of the students do a diary of racism. Of things that they've encountered during the day and it was shocking to me. I think I'm somebody who's very sensitive that how people felt they were being treated and so we all are in our own bubble. And sometimes we don't understand how other people are being treated.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

That's a way of educating people. And that's a big piece of it, is educating others and also saying, It's not right. This is not right how this person was being treated. For example, I had a student who recounted how she walked into a diner and she was the only African-American young woman. And she felt everybody stared at her and they didn't rush to give her a menu. Whereas, other people sat down after her and got a menu and it was something that she encountered on a daily basis. I think that's something that other people may not realize that is happening. So, our role can be to open people's eyes.

Alex:

Could I tell you how I would like to do it?

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

Sure.

Alex:

I want to have big parties, get together, with all of our friends and have a good time, and a lot of fun, and take a lot of pictures and share the pictures to show everybody that we are together. We're not apart. There's no reason for us not to be together. There's only the reason for us to be... Hey, listen. I grew up... I'm a Jew from Queens. I grew up on Chinese food. I cannot do without Chinese food. So what the heck is that? My friends that I played ball with were my black friends that they bused in the fifth grade, and they're still my friends. How is that not still happening today? We need to reinvent that and make it happen more.

Ms. Johnson:

Alex, that's a great idea. And as a matter of fact, Dr. Betty Campbell, I hope she's going to chime in. She says in the chat, having this discussion-

Dr. Betty Campbell:

I'm here.

Ms. Johnson:

Hey, there. How you doing? Chime in.

Dr. Betty Campbell:

I'm well. Wonderful program. I just wanted to chime in. Alex asked a very important question in terms of how do we begin to do this work? I think it's important for us to just begin engaging in the dialogue. Sometimes to be able to talk to friends, colleagues or those who are maybe outside of our circle about what's going on in and outside of our communities. I mean, sometimes we fail to realize what other people are going through. And someone made, mentioned earlier about the victimization and the traumatization that goes into when you're dealing with hate and the importance of communicating to victims that it is okay to speak out, but also being advocates and bringing these discussions to the forefront and thinking about it collectively and globally about how do we go forward and just informing people and supporting those who have been victimized by hate and racism.

Ms. Johnson:

Yes, absolutely. Absolutely. Dr. Betty, Jay Jacobs also said maybe we can start campaigns for love, equity and/or equality in the form of buttons and t-shirts, and he loves the diary idea that Justice Lee Cohen mentioned.

Jay Jacobs:

Good Afternoon.

Ms. Johnson:

Jay Jacobs?

Jay Jacobs:

Yes, yes. Ma'am.

Ms. Nadine Johnson:

Good Afternoon.

Jay Jacobs:

How are you? Thank you for this... Thank you for everybody that shared. I was thinking specifically as it relates to social media, because we don't, we are now, we are quarantined technically right now. So we're mostly online and I've seen and heard some people really post some poignant stuff regarding all of this. One Caucasian, young lady posted an apology towards all people of color, just for all the injustices forever that have occurred in this country since this establishment. And I noticed that sometimes people will write inappropriate, racist, slurs or comments right in the box. How can these people be held accountable as like hate crimes for something like this? I think that's a space that we can defend someone in that, but it kind of goes like a ping pong back and forth. And nobody's really being held accountable for it taking place right online in front of us.

Alex:

Listen, planned parties. We are going to be planning, parties. Kyle, and Gary and I are going to plan parties at my place and we're all invited and we're going to talk about all this stuff.

Ms. Johnson:

All right. So Jay Jacobs made an interesting point about commentary on social media. But now Justice Weber, we know that just mere commentary may not necessarily translate into actual crime so how do we -

Judge Webber:

No, it doesn't because of that first amendment thing there. So it wouldn't translate into an actual crime. However, he makes it an interesting point. And this is one of the issues that we have, is because that type of speech and those types of comments then lead to some others to then take action. And so that's where you have to really be careful because the argument is, well it's free speech, but individuals then take that and they run with it and then they commit crimes based upon what they see on social media. And so that's an ongoing issue.

Ms. Nadine Johnson:

Right.

new speaker:

The other thing is, if it's on Facebook, is that you actually can report. Sometimes these groups are, have rules and the person who's posting has broken a rule of profanity or racism or something like that. You can actually click and you'll see report to the administrator or report to Facebook. So you can do that as well. And you can also-

Judge Webber:

It tends to be directed at specific groups. And so the individuals that would see it are not going to actually complain about it, but you know, every once in a while you will see something, I'll get a stray message, that'll say something, but for the most part it's kind of targeted to a specific group. And those are the ones who are getting it. And yeah, you definitely can reported to the administrator if they're using profanity, but if they're just saying certain things like, this came from the Chinese or this is the Chinese floor or something like that, they're not going to necessarily take that down. And if you recall, Trump Jr. posted something, tweeted, something like that and there was this whole issue to whether Twitter should have allowed it or should not have allowed it. And basically it was, yeah, they should have allowed it. There's a student. Alicia, she has a, who can share an experience. Maybe do you see that?

Ms. Nadine Johnson:

Yes. Alicia, please chime in. Can you -

Alicia:

Hi, can you guys see me?

Ms. Johnson:

I can hear you.

Alicia:

Oh, okay. Well, I mean, I'm Hispanic, I'm Dominican and Puerto Rican, so, my -

Judge Webber:

Oh we can see you.

Ms. Johnson:

Hi there. We see you now.

Alicia:

Okay. So, I can, I have a couple of experiences with racism and being biased towards Hispanics and stuff. But I remember one time... I used to live in Brooklyn, so it was kind of like, I was always kind of seeing a lot of people not being the nicest to other people of color.

Alicia:

So I remember, I moved to a predominantly white neighborhood and it was the first time that I went to the supermarket with my mom. And it was like a lot of, mostly the people that worked there were white and me and my mom, we were just grocery shopping. And the entire time that we were shopping, someone was following us. And at first we didn't think anything of it. So we were like, Oh, okay, this is kind of, this is weird, but I mean, maybe they recognize us from somewhere or something like that. And the more we kept shopping and just looking around for stuff, they just kept following. And then we saw the badge that they were a worker there. And we were like, we turned around and we were like, what the hell? And then we heard one of the people whisper like, Oh, just keep an eye on them. And we bought our stuff and we left and we were like, that was just blatant racism. There was just no need. It was just a mother and her daughter shopping. There was no need to look at us a certain way.

Judge Webber:

Yeah. And then studies show that while they're following you, there's somebody else who is, maybe looks more like them who are doing all the stealing. There are tons of studies that talk about that. They're following you. They're following the African-American, they're following the Dominican, et cetera. But it's actually the white one who's stuffing all the merchandise in their bags and under their clothing and they're getting away free because they targeted you. And they thought that, again, it's profiling because they figure, Oh, if you're of color, you're going to be stealing. And doesn't that make you feel really demoralized?

Alicia:

Yeah. When I was younger, I was, I never really experienced anything like that. You know what I mean? I went to a school that was just predominantly African American and Hispanic. So it was like, we're just all here.

Judge Webber:

What's going on now? And then its like, why should I give them my money? You know what, if they're going to treat me like that, then why do I go, why should I go back to that store? You know what I mean?

Alicia:

Me and my mom never went back there. And then one time my mom, she actually, she went back to the store and there was an African-American woman that was the cashier. And she was like, Oh, hi, sweetheart, this and that and how are you? And my mom was just like, they were just chit chatting or

whatever. And she was on the phone with me while she was talking to her. And she was like, Oh, it's kind of late outside. Cause it was just really dark outside. She's like, yeah, I just came from work. I'm a social worker. And the, and the lady was like, Oh, that's really nice. And my mom told me that all of the people around her looked at, like looked at her like she had four heads. I was like, wow.

Judge Webber:

You're a social worker? How is that possible?

Alicia:

I was like, wow.

Judge Webber:

Yeah. Yeah. You're not a social worker. Yeah.

Ms. Johnson:

So Alicia, in any of the videos, did you identify with any of the people who told their stories, given your own experience?

Marilice:

I would like to share a story. Hi, I'm another student. Hi, my name is Marilice. I'm a part of council for unity as well. I haven't been talking because I've been trying to find a way to unmute myself.

Ms. Johnson:

We can hear you now.

Marilice:

Yeah. Okay.

Ms. Johnson:

This is going to be the last question or comment.

Marilice:

Well, I wanted to comment about the violence with the Asian Americans. I'm not Asian, I'm Dominican, but I have a friend that is Asian. And before the whole quarantine started, when everybody... when the Corona virus was starting to get around my friend, she goes to a different school. She actually had to leave school early because so many people inside her school was threatening to assault her when she leaves, when school finishes, just because she was Asian and because of the Corona virus. And the only way she got out there safely is that one student that, I believe was either white or Hispanic, one of those two, I forgot. She came up to my friend and warned her about it and helped her leave early from the back of the school and not in the front, since almost half of the school was waiting for her in the front, just to assault her.

Ms. Johnson:

And as a result of that, what happened? What happened? Did anyone report it? Did anyone videotape it or anything? Do you know?

Marilice:

Everybody was waiting with their phones to record the assault, but her friend was able, my friend was able to call her parents and they were able to pick her up early, bring her home, but it was very traumatic for both of them. Because she's the friend of another friend of mine and she told that friend of mine and a friend of mine told me, and we were just like, how could somebody ever choose to do that to a certain individual because of their own race. That's absurd. And how such a group, a large group of people were willing just to record that injustice just for entertainment. Basically, that was very absurd in my opinion.

Ms. Johnson:

Right? No, you're absolutely right. You have to be strong. I mean, and it goes to bullying. You know, it's a part of... There's general bullying, kids of the same race or ethnicity, bullying. I was, a target of bullying when I was at school. It's traumatic. It is terrible to have a group of kids follow you. It was, in my situation I guess it was a little different because you're the smart kid, the kid that looks a certain way or whatever, and other kids either don't like you, or because you're not joining in with maybe some of the bad things that kids are doing. But it takes a strong person to stand up and say, no, this is not right. It takes a strong person, a friend or someone to try to usher that person out.

Ms. Johnson:

Thank God your friend had her parents come early and get her out of there. But we hear far too many stories about this. And again, that's probably not something that would translate to a crime. All right. However, something like that can have devastating effects as we all know. People who are the subject of such traumatic bullying that they end up taking their lives and all of that sort of thing. And we want to do everything that we can as allies of people and just generally good people, like Justice Lee Cohen said "Be a force for good". So we want to do everything that we can to ameliorate these types of situations when we see them.

Ms. Johnson:

I can't tell you how many times I've encountered different things along the street, in the subways. And I said something, I said something about, but you also have to be careful because in this society that we live in, people are on the edge. You don't know where folks are coming from. You don't know if there's a mental history going on or something like that. So you do have to be careful. You have to be concerned about yourself as well. And if anything, you have to stand to the side, don't get in the way of police doing their business. We see lots of incidents of police activity on the street in, in this, in this pandemic with social distancing and trying to break up groups of people.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

Right. In terms of that particular incident though, I think that it could be, we don't know. I mean, it could have escalated if she had walked in. Certainly the police, if they had called, could have broken up that crowd and said, what are you standing here for? And then somebody will say, well, when you're waiting for somebody to come out. I mean, it could have been handled perhaps another way. I'm glad that the friend stood up and helped the young woman out of school, But certainly could have escalated into a crime. And it could have been something which the police could have naturally interjected.

Ms. Johnson:

Yeah. Yeah. Well, thank you for sharing.

Justice Doris Ling-Cohan:

Yes, Thank you for sharing.

Judge Webber:

I just want to say one last thing in terms of videotaping, there were couple of cases a year or so ago with individuals who were videotaping the police officers making an arrest, et cetera. And they too were arrested. The case law is pretty clear that you can videotape police officers doing whatever they're doing so long as you maintain a quote on quote safe distance from them. And so long as you're not interfering in any way with the arrest. So it's not like you can get right behind them and videotape what's going on. But so long as you keep, maintain a distance from them so that you're not interfering, you can videotape their actions.

Ms. Johnson:

Okay. Well, on that note, we will end. Thank you everyone for joining in. This has been a fantastic program. Thank you for all of your comments and sharing and great ideas. And please go out and continue these discussions amongst yourself, your peers, and others. And we will see you next time with another engaging wonderful program. Thank you to Justice Weber, Justice Lee Cohen, and Chris [inaudible 01:31:24] for their wonderful contributions. Thank you, Mary and Carlene and everyone. Thank you so much.

Judge Webber:

Kyle and Nadine. Nadine chimed in.

Ms. Johnson:

Kyle and [inaudible 01:31:35] . Yes, and all of the council for unity folks who have chimed in and of course to our wonderful, fantastic Bob. We wish him well. And thank you everyone.

Alex:

Peace love and happiness.

Jay Jacobs:

Thank you all so much.

Ms. Johnson:

Have a wonderful weekend. Thank you.

Alex:

Wow. Wow. Wow.

Ms. Johnson:

Thank you, Alex.

PART 4 OF 4 ENDS [01:32:15]