

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK**  
***Appellate Division, Fourth Judicial Department***

540

CA 24-01448

PRESENT: LINDLEY, J.P., CURRAN, BANNISTER, SMITH, AND NOWAK, JJ.

---

FRAGRANCE HARRIS STANFIELD, ET AL.,  
PLAINTIFFS-RESPONDENTS,

V

OPINION AND ORDER

MEAN LLC, ET AL., DEFENDANTS,  
ALPHABET INC., GOOGLE, LLC, YOUTUBE, LLC, AND  
REDDIT, INC., DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS.  
(APPEAL NO. 6.)

---

ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP, WASHINGTON D.C. (ERIC A. SHUMSKY,  
ADMITTED PRO HAC VICE, OF COUNSEL), WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI,  
P.C., NEW YORK CITY, WEBSTER SZANYI LLP, BUFFALO, AND PERKINS COIE  
LLP, NEW YORK CITY, FOR DEFENDANTS-APPELLANTS ALPHABET, INC., GOOGLE,  
LLC, YOUTUBE, LLC, AND REDDIT, INC.

TYCKO & ZAVAREEI LLP, WASHINGTON, D.C. (GLENN E. CHAPPELL, ADMITTED  
PRO HAC VICE, OF COUNSEL), EVERYTOWN LAW, NEW YORK CITY, AND LAW  
OFFICES OF BONNER AND BONNER, SAN RAFAEL, CALIFORNIA, FOR  
PLAINTIFFS-RESPONDENTS.

HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP, NEW YORK CITY (JASMEET K. AHUJA OF COUNSEL), FOR  
CHAMBER OF PROGRESS, ENGINE ADVOCACY, AND WIKIMEDIA FOUNDATION, AMICUS  
CURIAE.

HOLWELL SHUSTER & GOLDBERG LLP, NEW YORK CITY (DANIEL M. SULLIVAN OF  
COUNSEL), FOR PRODUCTS LIABILITY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AMICUS CURIAE.

CHELUS, HERDZIK, SPEYER & MONTE, P.C., BUFFALO (ISABELLA S. JANKOWSKI  
OF COUNSEL), FOR CENTER FOR DEMOCRACY AND TECHNOLOGY, AMICUS CURIAE.

---

Appeals from an order of the Supreme Court, Erie County (Paula L. Feroleto, J.), entered August 29, 2024. The order denied the motion of defendants-appellants to dismiss the second amended complaint against them.

It is hereby ORDERED that the order so appealed from is reversed on the law without costs, the motion is granted and the second amended complaint is dismissed against defendants-appellants.

Same opinion as in *Patterson v Meta Platforms, Inc.* ([appeal No. 1] – AD3d – [July 25, 2025] [4th Dept 2025]).

All concur except BANNISTER and NOWAK, JJ., who dissent and vote to

affirm in the same dissenting opinion as in *Patterson v Meta Platforms, Inc.* ([appeal No. 1] – AD3d – [July 25, 2025] [4th Dept 2025]).

Entered: July 25, 2025

Ann Dillon Flynn  
Clerk of the Court