

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, COUNTY OF NEW YORK: PART 3

-----X

Plaintiff(s)

- against -

Defendant(s)

-----X

Present:
Hon. EILEEN BRANSTEN

Index No.: _____

RJI Filing Date: _____

**NEW REVISED
PRELIMINARY
CONFERENCE
STIPULATION AND ORDER**
(3-08-2017)

I. APPEARANCES: Please include (1) your name; (2) your firm's name (3) your firm's address; (4) your firm's telephone number; (5) your direct telephone number; (6) your e-mail address and (7) the party you represent.

Plaintiff(s):

Defendant(s):

Please use additional pages, if necessary.

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

II. CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT AND ORDER:

The court recognizes that most cases in the Commercial Division involve facts that are highly sensitive. In such cases, in order for the parties to proceed to proper discovery, the parties should enter into a Confidentiality Agreement which the court will “So Order.”

The parties are directed to use the Model Confidentiality Agreement found in Attachment B of the Rules of the Trial Courts found at:

[https://www.nycourts.gov/rules/trialcourts/202.70\(g\)%20-%20Rule%2011-g%20\(attachment\).pdf](https://www.nycourts.gov/rules/trialcourts/202.70(g)%20-%20Rule%2011-g%20(attachment).pdf)

If the parties need to change the Confidentiality Agreement promulgated in the Trial Part or by the City Bar, the parties are to submit a **signed** Confidentiality Agreement with the changes and a red line copy for the court’s review.

The parties _____ **HAVE** or _____ **HAVE NOT** entered into a Confidentiality Agreement.

The Court _____ **HAS** or _____ **HAS NOT** “So Ordered” the Confidentiality Agreement and, if the Court has “So Ordered” it, on what date did the Court “So Order” it: _____

The parties _____ **WILL** or _____ **WILL NOT** be entering into a Confidentiality Agreement. If the parties **WILL**, please indicate when the parties expect to enter into the Confidentiality Agreement: _____

If the parties have decided that they **WILL NOT** enter into a Confidentiality Agreement, please provide the Court with a brief explanation as to the reason(s) the parties have decided **not** to enter into a Confidentiality Agreement.

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

III. PRE-ANSWER MOTIONS

(a) Has the Plaintiff served an amended complaint?

If so, when _____

What are the changes to the Complaint from the original to the amended complaint:

(b) Did Defendant(s) make a pre-answer motion to dismiss?

____ YES ____ NO

(c) When did the Court render its decision on the Motion to Dismiss?

(d) Is the Court's decision on Appeal?

____ YES ____ NO

(e) What Causes of Action remain in the Complaint after the Court's decision?

- (i) _____
- (ii) _____
- (iii) _____
- (other) _____

(f) When did the Defendant(s) file their answer and counterclaims to the Complaint:

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

IV. DESCRIPTION OF THE CASE: Pursuant to **22 NYCRR 202.12(c)(1)**, please provide a brief description of the factual and legal issues raised in the pleadings of the case:

(a) Plaintiff's salient facts in support of claims/counterclaim defenses:

Amount Demanded: \$ _____

(b) If issue has been joined (i.e. if Defendant has answered the Complaint) Defendant _____'s, salient facts in support of defenses, counterclaims and Third-Party Claims.

Amount Demanded on the Counterclaim/Third-Party Claims: _____

If there are multiple defendants:

(c) If issue has been joined (i.e. if Defendant has answered the Complaint), Defendant, _____'s, salient facts in support of defenses, counterclaims and Third Party Claims.

Amount Demanded on the Counterclaim/Third-Party Claims: _____

Please use additional sheets, if needed.

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

V. DISCOVERY

It is hereby **ORDERED** that disclosure shall proceed pursuant to the Commercial Division Rules found at

<http://www.nycourts.gov/rules/trialcourts/202.shtml#70>

(1) GENERAL ADMONITIONS:

The Preamble to the Commercial Division Rules, **22 NYCRR 202.70(g)**, states that the parties should be “mindful of the need to conserve client resources, *encourage proportionality in discovery*, promote efficient resolution of matters, and increase respect for the integrity of the judicial process.” (Emphasis added.) Litigants and counsel who appear in this Court are directed to review the Rules regarding sanctions, including the provisions in Rule 12 regarding failure to appear at a conference, Rule 13(a) regarding adherence to discovery schedules, and Rule 24(d) regarding the need of counsel to be fully familiar with the case when making appearances
.....

Have you met and conferred concerning discovery?

_____ **YES** _____ **NO**. If **YES**, **when** did you meet and confer? _____

Have you adjusted your discovery demands in order to comply with the “*proportionality in discovery*” admonition in the Commercial Division Rules? _____ **YES** _____ **NO**

(2) DOCUMENT PRODUCTION

All documents produced by any and all parties and non-parties MUST be Bates Stamped.

Pursuant to **Rule 11-e(a)**, “For each document request propounded, the responding party shall, in its Response and Objections served pursuant to CPLR 3122(a) (the "Responses"), either:

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

(a) state that the production will be made as requested; or

(b) state with reasonable particularity the grounds for any objection to production.

(a) Initial demands for discovery and inspection shall be served by all parties on or before

_____.

(b) Responses to demands shall be served by all parties on or before

_____.

(c) By what date will the parties be able to **complete** Document Discovery:

_____.

(3) INTERROGATORIES

Pursuant to **Rule 11-a**, "Interrogatories (a) are limited to 25 in number, including subparts, unless another limit is specified in the Preliminary Conference Order. This limit applies to consolidated actions as well; (b) Unless otherwise ordered by the court, interrogatories are limited to the following topics: name of witnesses with knowledge of information material and necessary to the subject matter of the action, computation of each category of damage alleged, and the existence, custodian, location and general description of material and necessary documentation, including pertinent insurance agreements, and other physical evidence.

(a) Interrogatories shall be served by all parties on or before

_____.

(b) Answer to interrogatories shall be served on or before

_____.

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

The essential elements of the new Rule are (emphasis added):

- (i) A party wishing to take a deposition of an entity will serve a notice or subpoena enumerating those matters to be the subject of the deposition **“with reasonable particularity.”**
- (ii) If the notice or subpoena *does not* name a particular officer, director, member or employee of the entity, the named entity must designate one or more officers, directors, members or employees or other individual(s) who **consents to testify** on its behalf; the identity, description and title of that individual; and the matter(s) on which that individual will testify.
- (iii) If the notice or subpoena *does* name a particular officer, director, member or employee of the entity, the entity, pursuant to CPLR 3106(d), shall produce that individual, **unless**, no later than ten days before the deposition, the entity designates *another individual* who **consents to testify** on its behalf, in the place of the named or subpoenaed officer, director, member or employee of the entity; and shall provide the identification, description or title of the new individual, and the matter(s) on which the individual will testify.
- (iv) Deposition testimony given pursuant to this Rule shall be usable against the entity on whose behalf the testimony is given to the same extent provided in CPLR 3117(2).
- (v) The deposition of an entity shall be treated as a *single deposition* even though more than one person may be designated to testify on the entity’s behalf. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the cumulative presumptive (seven hour) durational limit is in effect **but** may be enlarged by agreement of the parties or upon application for leave of Court, which shall be freely given.

Names of entities to be deposed:

- (i) For Plaintiff: _____
- (ii) For Plaintiff: _____
- (iii) For Defendant(s): _____

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

**New Revised Preliminary
Conference Order
Part 3 (9-28-2015)
Page 9 out of 17**

(iv) For Defendant(s): _____

Please use additional sheet if necessary.

ALL ENTITY DEPOSITIONS WILL BE COMPLETED on or before

(6) DISCLOSURE DISPUTES

Pursuant to Rule 14, and the **Part 3 Rules**, discovery disputes will be resolved in the following manner:

A party with a disclosure dispute shall write a letter to the Part 3, maximum 3-page single spaced in length, outlining the issue(s); the other side(s) may submit response letter(s) of equal length. The Part will then schedule a conference to resolve the dispute.

(7) IMPLAIDER:

Defendant shall serve his Third-Party summons and complaint no later than 30 days after the end of the last deposition of a named Plaintiff and Defendant(s) and/or the last deposition of a representative of a named party.

(8) ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY AND PRIVILEGE LOGS

Discovery of Electronically Stored Information (ESI) is one of the most expensive and challenging discovery categories. The Rules, as it concerns electronic discovery, **22 NYCRR 202.12(b) and (c)(3)**, as well as the related privilege logs, are an attempt to rein in the cost and complexity of electronic discovery and related privilege logs. In assessing whether the matter before the Court will benefit from electronic discovery, the parties should consider: (i) is there potentially relevant ESI material in the case; (ii) do the parties intend to rely on ESI; (iii) are there less costly or less burdensome alternatives to secure the necessary information without recourse to discovery of the ESI;

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

(iv) is the cost of preserving and producing ESI proportionate to the amount in controversy; and (v) what is the likelihood that discovery of ESI will aid in the resolution of the dispute.

A. ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY

(a) Will there be Electronic Discovery in the case:

___ **YES** ___ **NO** ___ **NOT SURE**

(b) **Meet and Confer:** Pursuant to Uniform Commercial Division Rule 8(b), **22 NYCRR 202.70(g)(8)(b)**, counsel **MUST** certify that they have *met and conferred* regarding electronic discovery, *before* the Preliminary Conference

(i) Date(s) parties had their meet and confer conference(s):

(ii) Did the parties reach an agreement concerning electronic discovery

___ **YES** ___ **NO** ___ **PARTIALLY**

(iii) Are counsel at this Preliminary Conference sufficiently versed in matters related to their client's technological systems to discuss competently all issues relating to electronic discovery:

___ **YES** ___ **NO**

(c) **Other directives concerning electronic discovery.**

The following topics are to be updated and supplemented as new information becomes available.

(I) **Preservation: 22 NYCRR 202.12(c)(3)(a), (c) and (g)**

(ii) **Production: 22 NYCRR 202.12(c)(3)(e),(d)**

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

- (iv) **Claw Back Provisions** for inadvertent production:
- (v) **Costs:** Each party shall bear its own costs of production pursuant to *U.S. Bank Nat'l Assoc. v. Greenpoint Mtge. Funding Inc.* 94 A.D.3d 58 (1st Dep't 2012). In the event that cost shifting becomes an issue, the parties shall follow the mechanism for Disclosure Dispute found in section (6).

(d) Judicial Intervention

The parties anticipate the need for judicial intervention.

___ **YES** ___ **NO** ___ **MAYBE**

(e) Discovery of Electronically Stored Information from Non-Parties:

Parties and non-parties should adhere to the Commercial Division's Guidelines for Discovery of Electronically Stored Information (ESI) from non-parties which can be found in Appendix A to the Rules of the Commercial Division.

B. PRIVILEGE LOGS

One of the most time-consuming and costly aspects of discovery in complex commercial litigation cases is the creation and maintenance of privilege logs. At present, privilege logs are governed by CPLR 3122(b) which mandates "that a party who intends to withhold documents because of privilege (must) prepare a 'privilege log' which (i) contains a separate entry for each document being withheld; (ii) provides 'pedigree' information for each such document and (iii) sets forth the specific privileges and immunities that insulate that document from production. (Memorandum concerning Privilege Log Practices in the Commercial Division at p.1)

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

New Revised Preliminary
Conference Order
Part 3 (9-28-2015)
Page 12 out of 17

THE CATEGORICAL or DOCUMENT-BY-DOCUMENT APPROACH

(a) Rule 11-b **mandates** that the parties meet and confer at the outset of the case and from time to time thereafter to discuss:

- the scope of the privilege review;
- the amount of information to be set out in the privilege log;
- the use of categories to reduce document-by-document logging;
- whether categories of information can be excluded from the logging requirements;
- any other issues pertinent to privilege review. (Rule 11-b(a))

(b) (1) The rule clearly states that the preference in the Commercial Division is for the parties to use **categorical designations** where appropriate to reduce the time and costs associated with preparing privilege logs. . . . (An example of such a **categorical designation** is the designation that all communications between the client and the client's attorney AFTER the commencement of the action would be designated as exempt pursuant to the attorney-client privilege.) . . . The parties are encouraged to utilize a reasoned method of organizing the documents . . .

*There are specific rules that must be followed to ensure that the documents contained in a **categorical designation** were properly placed in that category.*

(2) In the event the requesting party refuses to permit a **categorical approach**, and instead insists on a **document-by-document** listing on the privilege log then . . . the requirements of CPLR 3122 must be followed. In that circumstance, however, the producing party, upon showing of good cause, may apply to the court for an allocation of costs, including attorneys' fees, incurred with respect to preparing a **document-by-document** privilege log

(3) Even if a party insists on a **document-by-document** privilege log as contemplated by CPLR 3122 . . . each uninterrupted e-mail chain shall constitute a single entry, and the description

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

accompanying the entry shall include the following: (i) an indication that the e-mail chain represents an uninterrupted dialogue; (ii) the beginning and ending dates and times (as noted in the e-mails) of the dialogue; (iii) the number of e-mails in the dialogue; and (iv) the names of all the authors and recipients, together with sufficient identifying information about each person (e.g. name of the employer, job title, person's role in the case) to allow for a considered assessment of the privilege issue.

While there are other important section of the new Privilege Log Rule that will have to be considered and followed, these sections need not be repeated here.

- (c) Have both the Plaintiff and Defendant(s) read the Rules concerning Electronically Stored Information (ESI) and the new Privilege Logs:

Plaintiff: _____ **YES** **NO**
Defendant: _____ **YES** **NO**
Defendant: _____ **YES** **NO**

Please use additional sheets if necessary.

- (d) Pursuant to the new Electronic Discovery and Privilege Log Rules, have the parties met and conferred concerning ESI and Privilege Logs:

YES **NO**

- (e) If the Parties have met and conferred, when did they meet:

- (f) Will the parties be choosing:

Categorical Privilege Log: **YES** **NO**

OR **Document-by-Document Privilege Log:**

YES **NO**

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

(9) END DATE OF FACT DISCLOSURE:

Fact Disclosure shall be completed by _____

(10) EXPERT DISCOVERY (if any):

Pursuant to Rule 13(c), **22 NYCRR 202.70(g)(13(c))**, the Court hereby ORDERS that if any party intends to introduce expert testimony at trial or in support of a motion for summary judgment, the parties, no later than thirty (30) days prior to the completion of fact discovery, shall confer on a schedule for expert disclosure – including the identification of experts, the agreement to exchange expert reports and the timetable for the deposition of testifying experts. Expert disclosure shall be completed no later than four (4) months after the completion of fact discovery.

In the event that a party objects to this procedure or timetable, the parties shall request a conference to discuss the objection(s) with the Court.

The Note of Issue and Certificate of Readiness may not be filed until the completion of expert disclosure.

Do the parties believe that there will be expert discovery in this case?

____ YES

____ NO

(11) END DATE OF ALL DISCOVERY:

(12) NOTE OF ISSUE:

_____ shall file a note of issue/certificate of readiness on or before _____.

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

A copy of this P.C. order and all subsequent Compliance and Status Conference Order must be served and filed with the Note of Issue.

(13) DISPOSITIVE MOTION(S):

All dispositive motion(s) shall be made within 30 days after the filing of the Note of Issue.

***Please Note:** If a party intends to use documents in their dispositive motion that the party wishes to file in a redacted form or under seal, the party must make an application to the court under **Rule 216.1(a)** to have the Court issue a **written decision** specifying that there is “good cause” for such document(s) to be filed in a redacted form or under seal. This should be done **PRIOR** to making a dispositive motion.*

Such dispositive motions may be filed by Order to Show Cause or Notice of Motion. The Court encourages the parties to confer and agree on the dates for the opposition and reply papers to be exchanged and e-filed.

(14) COMPLIANCE CONFERENCE:

Parties or their representatives **with knowledge of the case and this Preliminary Conference Order** shall appear for a *Compliance* Conference on:

Parties or their representatives **with knowledge of the case and this Preliminary Conference Order** shall appear as well at all *subsequent* Status Conferences.

VI. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION

Justice Eileen Bransten, Part 3 of the Commercial Division, encourages all parties to work toward a proper and just resolution of all the issues in the case. Justice Bransten believes that the parties are better served the earlier a proper and just resolution can be reached. Toward that end, Justice Bransten asks the

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

litigants and their attorneys, on a *continuous basis going forward*, to consider any and all mechanisms to resolve the issues before them.

- ___ • settlement conferences;
- ___ • participation in the Commercial Division's Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) and/or
- ___ • retention of a private mediator.

Please indicate when the parties believe they will be ready to commence their chosen mechanism to resolve the issues in the case:

- ___ (a) Within sixty (60) days of the Preliminary Conference;
- ___ (b) Within thirty (30) days after document and interrogatory discovery has been completed;
- ___ (c) When depositions of the parties have been completed; or
- ___ (d) After the close of Fact Discovery and during the four month period of Expert Discovery.

VII. ADDITIONAL DIRECTIVES:

Please follow the specific Rules found under the Part Rules of the Judge before whom you are appearing.

Please be aware of and follow **all** the Rules found at **22 NYCRR 202.70(g)**. Particularly, please comply with the following two Rules:

Rule 2: Parties shall **immediately** inform the court that an action has settled, been discontinued or disposed of by submission of a stipulation or a letter;

Plaintiff _____
v. Defendant _____

Index Number: _____

**New Revised Preliminary
Conference Order
Part 3 (9-28-2015)
Page 17 out of 17**

Rule 5: ALL counsel **MUST** sign up for the FREE *eTrack* court notification service to keep track of future court appearances. The *eTrack* service is separate and apart from the e-filing system. Counsel are also responsible for notifying all other counsel of future court appearances. Please review the *eTrack* “Frequently Asked Questions” for details.

**THE DATES SET FORTH HEREIN MAY NOT BE ADJOURNED
EXCEPT WITH THE PRIOR APPROVAL OF THE COURT.**

***THE PARTIES MUST BRING COPIES OF ALL DISCLOSURE
ORDERS TO ALL CONFERENCES.***

**THIS PRELIMINARY CONFERENCE ORDER AND THE DATES CONTAINED
THEREIN ARE:**

Agreed to by: _____
Counsel for Plaintiff

Agreed to by: _____
Counsel for Defendant

Agreed to by: _____
Counsel for Defendant

Please use additional pages, if necessary.

SO ORDERED:

DATE: _____

HON. EILEEN BRANSTEN J.S.C.