State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

June 15, 2023

CASES

2 No. 72 SSM 3
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Herman Anthony,

Appellant.

1 No. 51
IKB International, S.A., &c., et al.,
Respondents,
V.
Wells Fargo Bank, N.A., &c., et al.,
Appellants,
ABFC 2006-OPT1 Trust, et al.,
Nominal Defendants.
(And Three Other Actions.)

3 No. 47
The People &c. ex rel. Danny Rivera,
Appellant,
v.
Superintendent, Woodbourne Correctional
Facility, et al.,
Respondents.

On review of submissions pursuant to section 500.11 of the Rules, order affirmed, without costs, in a memorandum.

Judges Garcia, Singas, Cannataro, Troutman and Halligan concur.

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Chief Judge Wilson concurs.

Order insofar as appealed from modified, without costs, in accordance with the opinion herein, as so modified, affirmed, and certified question answered in the negative.

Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Judges Rivera, Singas and Cannataro concur. Chief Judge Wilson dissents in part in an opinion. Judge Troutman dissents in part in a separate opinion. Judge Halligan took no part.

Order insofar as appealed from affirmed, without costs.

Opinion by Judge Singas.

Judges Garcia, Cannataro and Troutman concur. Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion, in which Chief Judge Wilson concurs.

Judge Halligan dissents in a separate opinion.

4 No. 46
The People &c. ex rel. E.S.,
Respondent,
v.
Superintendent, Livingston Correctional
Facility et al.,
Appellants.

4 No. 50
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Christopher J. Weber,
Appellant.

2 No. 49
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Michael Worley,
Appellant.

Order insofar as appealed from reversed, without costs, proceeding converted to a declaratory judgment action and judgment granted in accordance with the opinion herein.

Opinion by Judge Halligan.

Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia, Singas, Cannataro and Troutman concur.

Order appealed from and Appellate Division order brought up for review affirmed, without costs. Opinion by Judge Halligan. Judges Rivera, Garcia, Singas and Cannataro concur. Chief Judge Wilson dissents in an opinion. Judge Troutman took no part.

Order reversed, without costs, and matter remitted to Supreme Court, Kings County, for further proceedings in accordance with the opinion herein. Opinion by Judge Rivera. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Troutman and Halligan concur. Judge Garcia concurs in an opinion, in which Judges Singas and Cannataro concur.

MOTIONS

Mo. No. 2023-229 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction In the Matter of 865 First LLC, disbursements. Appellant, New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal et al., Respondents. Motion by Steven Thaler et al. for reargument of Mo. No. 2023-231 motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Kathryn Arntzen et al., Judge Halligan took no part. Appellants, Steven Thaler et al., Appellants, v. City of New York, Respondent. Mo. No. 2023-256 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Jeriah Bamugo, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-291 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Adam Burgio, Appellant.

Mo. No. 2023-212 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Hector Castillo, disbursements. Appellant, v. West End Towers LLC, et al., Respondents. (And a Third-Party Action.) Mo. No. 2023-190 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction In the Matter of Colonie Center, &c., disbursements. Appellant, v. Town of Colonie et al., Respondents. (And Two Other Related Proceedings.) Mo. No. 2023-208 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Robert Cornwell, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-244 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Deutsche Bank National Trust Company, &c., does not finally determine the action within the Appellant, meaning of the Constitution. v. Jorge Velazquez, et al., Defendants. Point Holding Alpha, LLC, Nonparty-Respondent. Mo. No. 2023-124 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Valentino Dixon, Appellant, v. State of New York,

Respondent.

1 Mo. No. 2023-196

Nigel John Eccles, et al., Appellants,

v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

Mo. No. 2023-263

Nigel John Eccles, et al., Appellants,

v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-265

Nigel John Eccles, et al., Appellants,

v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-276

Nigel John Eccles, et al., Appellants,

v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

1 Mo. No. 2023-304

Nigel John Eccles, et al., Appellants,

v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal granted. Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Motion by Business Council of New York State, Inc. for leave to appear amicus curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed.

Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Motion by Patrick M. Connors for leave to appear amicus curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed

Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Motion by Patrick J. Borchers, et al. for leave to appear amici curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed.

Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Motion by New York State Trial Lawyers' Association for leave to appear amicus curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein and to join the amicus curiae brief by Patrick M. Connors granted. Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed as untimely (see CPLR 5513 [b]; Eaton v State of New York, 76 In the Matter of the Claim of David J. NY2d 824 [1990]). Eisenberg, Respondent. Censeohealth LLC, Appellant. Commissioner of Labor, Respondent. Mo. No. 2023-262 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Dale Finster, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-237 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Ann Florsheim, Appellant, v. Marriott International, Inc., &c., et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2023-259 Motion for leave to appeal denied. 1 Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, Hector Hernandez, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-203 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Christopher Howell,

3

Mo. No. 2023-246

Appellant.

Mo. No. 2023-277 The People &c., Respondent, v. Laron Jackson,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2023-242 Elizabeth M. Kairey, Respondent, v. Elliot M. Hirsch,

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Mo. No. 2023-147 In the Matter of Kasowitz, Benson, Torres & Friedman, LLP, Petitioner,

Appellant.

v.

JPMorgan Chase Bank, N.A., Appellant,

The Dakota, Inc.,

Respondent,

Alphonse Fletcher, Jr.,

Respondent;

Fletcher International, Ltd., et al., Intervenors-Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal granted. Judge Garcia took no part.

Mo. No. 2023-206 Franciszek C. Kulon,

Appellant,

v.

Liberty Fire District et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Berkeley Capital LLC, et al., Defendants, Rosa Bronstein, et al., Respondents, Oceana Holding Corp., Respondent. Joseph Paukman, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-227 2 The People &c., Respondent, v. Frank Molinaro, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-209 The People &c., Respondent, v. Robert Musmacker, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-217 Nassau Property Investors, LLC,

Respondent,

Appellant,

Defendants:

Incorporated Village of Hempstead, Intervenor-Respondent.

v. Jason Goffe,

et al.,

Mo. No. 2023-254

Faye T. Madigan, &c.,

Plaintiff,

v.

On the Court's own motion, appeal dismissed, without costs, upon the ground that the order appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Mo. No. 2023-280 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Derrick Neal, Appellant. 1 Mo. No. 2023-214 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Jolifier Noe, et al., Appellants, v. Local 983, et al., Respondents. 1 Mo. No. 2023-114 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Marina V. Oetiker, disbursements. Appellant, v. Hudson River Park Trust, Respondent, et al., Defendant. 2 Mo. No. 2023-173 Motion for leave to appeal granted. Ana Orellana, Appellant, Town of Carmel, et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2023-194 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Paul Orlando, Respondent, v. County of Putnam, Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2022-782
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Mark Rodriguez,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

2 Mo. No. 2023-230 Seagate Mini Mall, Inc., et al., Appellants, V. Seagate Association, Inc., Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

2 Mo. No. 2023-258 In the Matter of William Shankle, Appellant, v. Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that no appeal lies to this Court from the decision of an individual Justice of the Appellate Division.

Vincent Del Guidice, &c., et al., Respondents.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Respondent.

Mo. No. 2023-225
 In the Matter of Jeffrey Terborg,

 Appellant,
 V.

 New York State Department of Corrections and Community Supervision,

ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for ancillary relief dismissed upon the ground that this Court does not have jurisdiction to

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the

entertain it (see NY Const, art VI, § 3).

2 Mo. No. 2023-235 Marianella Velasquez, &c., Appellant, V. Sunstone Red Oak, LLC, &c., et al., Respondents. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

1 Mo. No. 2023-218 Linda Grant Williams, Appellant,

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Garcia took no part.

v. Citigroup, Inc., et al., Respondents.

4 Mo. No. 2023-241
Thomas C. Wilmot, Sr., et al.,
Respondents,
v.
Tony Kirik,

Appellant, County of Monroe,

Respondent.

Motion for reconsideration of this Court's February 14, 2023 dismissal order dismissed as untimely (*see* Rules of the Ct of Appeals [22 NYCRR] § 500.24 [b]).

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.

Judge Halligan took no part.