

**Golden Gate Yacht Club v Societe Nautique De
Geneve**

2008 NY Slip Op 32296(U)

May 12, 2008

Supreme Court, New York County

Docket Number: 0602446/2007

Judge: Herman Cahn

Republished from New York State Unified Court
System's E-Courts Service.
Search E-Courts (<http://www.nycourts.gov/ecourts>) for
any additional information on this case.

This opinion is uncorrected and not selected for official
publication.

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF NEW YORK: IAS Part 49

-----X
GOLDEN GATE YACHT CLUB,

Plaintiff,

- against -

Index No. 602446/07

ORDER

SOCIÉTÉ NAUTIQUE DE GENÈVE,

Defendant,

CLUB NÁUTICO ESPAÑOL DE VELA,

Intervenor-Defendant.

-----X
HERMAN CAHN, J.:

Plaintiff Golden Gate Yacht Club ("GGYC") in motion sequence number 001 having moved this Court for a preliminary injunction and expedited discovery and an expedited trial, and non-parties Reale Yacht Club Canottieri Savoia and Mascalzone Latino (collectively, "Amici") in motion sequence number 002 having moved this Court for leave to file an amici curiae brief, and Defendant Société Nautique de Genève ("SNG") in motion sequence number 003 having moved this Court to dismiss and for summary judgment, and GGYC in motion sequence number 003 having cross-moved this Court for an order pursuant to N.Y. C.P.L.R. 3211(c) and 3212 granting GGYC's cross-motion for summary judgment, together with such further and other relief as this Court deems just and proper, and Intervenor-Defendant Club Náutico Español de Vela ("CNEV") in motion sequence number 004 having moved this Court for summary judgment and an order dismissing Plaintiff's claims;

FILED

MAY 13 2008

NEW YORK
COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE

001
002
003
004
Expedited

E

NOW, upon reading and filing the following papers submitted to the Court: **Motion Sequence number 001**: GGYC's Order to Show Cause, dated August 22, 2007, and the accompanying Memorandum of Law, the Affirmation of Gina M. Petrocelli and the Affidavit of Thomas F. Ehman, including the exhibits attached thereto; SNG's September 5, 2007 Memorandum of Law in Opposition and the September 5, 2007 Affidavits of Hamish Ross and Miquel Terrasa Monasterio, including the exhibits attached thereto; **Motion Sequence number 002**: Amici's October 5, 2007 Order to Show Cause and the Affirmation of Lance J. Gotko, including the exhibits attached thereto; SNG's October 12, 2007 Response to Proposed Amici's Application; **Motion Sequence numbers 003 and 004**: SNG's September 21 Notice of Motion and Memorandum of Law, the Affidavit of Hamish Ross and Affirmation of David G. Hille including the exhibits thereto, and SNG's September 21, 2007 Commercial Division Rule 19-a Statement of Material Facts; CNEV's September 21, 2007 Notice of Motion and the Affidavit of Manuel Jose Chirivella Bonet; GGYC's October 5, 2007 Notice of Cross-Motion, Memorandum of Law, the Affidavit of Thomas F. Ehman, Jr. and Affirmation of James V. Kearney including the exhibits thereto, and GGYC's Commercial Division Rule 19-a Statement of Material Facts, and Response to SNG's Commercial Division Rule 19-a Statement of Material Facts; SNG's October 12, 2007 Memorandum of Law, Response to Plaintiff's Commercial Division Rule 19-a Statement, the Affidavit of Hamish Ross, including the exhibits thereto and CNEV's October 12, 2007 Reply Memorandum of Law and Response to Plaintiff's Commercial Division Rule 19-a Statement and the Affidavit of Manuel Jose Chirivella Bonet and Affirmation of Catherine M. Doll, including the exhibits attached thereto, and GGYC's October 19, 2007 Reply Memorandum of Law and Affirmation of Gina M. Petrocelli, including the exhibits attached thereto;

AND upon reading and filing the following additional papers submitted to the Court: SNG's December 27, 2007 Notice of Motion and Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion to Renew and Reargue pursuant to CPLR 2221, the Affidavit of Fred Meyer and the exhibits attached thereto; GGYC's January 2, 2008 Memorandum of Law in Opposition to SNG's Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion to Renew and Reargue, the Affirmation of Gina M. Petrocelli and the exhibits attached thereto; SNG's January 14, 2008 Order to Show Cause, the Affirmation of Jonathan K. Youngwood and the exhibits attached thereto; the January 23, 2008 Affirmation of Gina M. Petrocelli and the exhibits attached thereto; the January 28, 2008 Affirmation of Barry R. Ostrager and the exhibits attached thereto; GGYC's March 26, 2008 Notice of Filing and the exhibit attached thereto; SNG's March 28, 2008 Notice of Filing and the exhibit attached thereto; GGYC's April 1, 2008 Notice of Filing and the exhibit attached thereto; SNG's April 2, 2008 Notice of Filing and the exhibit attached thereto;

AND upon hearing oral argument from counsel for the parties on September 10, 2007, October 22, 2007, January 14, 2008, January 23, 2008, and April 2, 2008;

AND, upon all prior pleadings and proceedings hereto;

AND, upon the Decision and Order issued by this Court on November 27, 2007 (the "November 27, 2007 Decision") granting Plaintiff GGYC's cross-motion for summary judgment, dismissing GGYC's breach of fiduciary duty claim against SNG and directing the parties to "Settle Order", a true copy of which is annexed hereto as Exhibit A;

AND, whereas, on July 11, 2007, GGYC issued a "Notice of Challenge for the America's Cup" ("Notice of Challenge") that the Court determined to be a valid challenge in its November 27, 2007 Decision; whereas, at a September 10, 2007 hearing before the Court on GGYC's motion for preliminary injunction and expedited discovery, the Court inquired whether

the parties would enter into an agreement, pursuant to which the date for the challenge match races prescribed in the Deed of Gift would be extended following a final decision on the merits of this litigation, and counsel for the parties agreed to attempt to negotiate a stipulation tolling the notice period pending a final decision on the merits; it is hereby

ORDERED that the Motion, sequence number 001 for preliminary injunction and expedited discovery and an expedited trial, is denied as moot; and it is further

ORDERED that the Motion, sequence number 002 for leave to file an amici curiae brief, is granted; and it is further

ORDERED that Defendant SNG's Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment in sequence number 003 is granted to the extent it dismisses GGYC's breach of fiduciary duty cause of action, and Plaintiff GGYG's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment in sequence number 003 is granted; and it is further

ORDERED that the Motion, sequence number 004 by CNEV for Summary Judgment and to Dismiss GGYC's claims, is denied; and it is further

ORDERED and adjudged that CNEV's challenge is invalid, and CNEV is not a valid Challenger of Record pursuant to the Deed of Gift; and it is further

ORDERED and adjudged that GGYC's challenge is valid, and GGYC is the Challenger of Record pursuant to the Deed of Gift; and it is further

ORDERED that the dates for the challenge match races shall be the date ten calendar months from the date of service of a copy of this order, with notice of entry, upon the attorneys who have appeared herein, unless said date is a Sunday or legal holiday, in which case the next day shall be the first date of the challenge match races. The second date shall be two business

days thereafter and the third date, if necessary, shall be two business days after the second race. Notwithstanding the above, the parties may mutually agree in writing to other dates.

ORDERED that the location of the match shall be in Valencia, Spain or any other location selected by SNG, provided SNG notify GGYC in writing not less than six months in advance of the date set for the first challenge match race of the location it has selected for the challenge match races; and it is further

ORDERED that GGYC and SNG may engage in a mutual consent process and make any arrangement satisfactory to both as to the dates, courses, number of trials, rules and sailing regulations, and any and all other conditions of the challenge match races in accordance with the Deed of Gift; and it is further

ORDERED that the Clerk of Court is directed to enter judgment accordingly.

Dated: May 12, 2008

ENTER:

FILED

MAY 13 2008

[Handwritten Signature]

J.S.C.

NEW YORK
COUNTY CLERK'S OFFICE